SENATE SECRETARIAT

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON RULES OF PROCEDURE AND PRIVILEGES

REPORT NO. 9 OF 2011 (PRIVILEGES)

REGARDING WRONG ANSWER GIVEN TO QUESTION NO.85, ON 31ST MARCH, 2011, BY THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE REGARDING RECRUITMENTS IN PIA

I, Chairman of the Committee on Rules of Procedure and Privileges, have the honour to present report of the Committee on the question of privilege raised by Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan in the sitting of the Senate held on 5th April, 2011, on the wrong answer given to question No.85, on 31st March, 2011, by the Ministry of Defence regarding recruitments in PIA.

2. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan moved the privilege motion in the sitting of the Senate held on 5th April, 2011 which the Chairman held in order and referred to the Committee for consideration and report.

3. The composition of the Committee is as under:-

1.	*Senator Syed Tahir Hussain Mashhadi*	*Chairman*
2.	*Senator Mian Raza Rabbani*	*Member*
3.	*Senator Salahuddin Dogar*	*Member*
4.	*Senator Syeda Sughra Imam*	*Member*
5.	*Senator Abbas Khan*	*Member*
6.	*Senator Dr. Muhammad Ismail Buledi*	*Member*
7.	*Senator Prof. Sajid Mir*	*Member*
8.	*Senator Wasim Sajjad*	*Member*
9.	*Minister for Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs*	*Ex-Officio Member*

4. The Committee in its sitting held on 18th May, 2011, considered the Privilege Motion. The following Members attended the meeting :-

1.	Senator Syed Tahir Hussain Mashhadi	Chairman
2.	Senator Mian Raza Rabbani	Member

3.	Senator Salahuddin Dogar	Member
4.	Senator Syeda Sughra Imam	Member
5.	Senator Dr. Muhammad Ismail Buledi	Member
6.	Senator Prof. Sajid Mir	Member
7.	Senator Wasim Sajjad	Member
8.	Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan	Mover

5. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan in his question of privilege interalia stated as under:-

"(i) To fill some vacancies PIA advertised posts on 8th March, 2009. Thereafter test and interview were held. One of the applicants namely Malik Muhammad Akram was not appointed despite qualifying the test and interview. In reply to his letter to PIA Director Human Resource (Admn and Coordination) he was informed that the said applicant has not been considered suitable for the post by the Selection Board.

(ii) In reply to his question No.85 asked on 31st March, 2011, Minister for Defence gave the details of applicants whose tests and interviews were taken. According to it the applicant Malik Muhammad Akram S/O Malik Muhammad Ibrahim bearing role No.MUX – 2943 was not selected while candidates having lower marks were selected.

(iii) In the above matter the PIA authorities have made a wrong statement causing breach of his privilege as a member as well as of the whole House.".

6. Ministry of Defence in their written comments informed the Committee as under :-

"(i) PIAC advertised the position of Assistants in the press on 8th March, 2009. In response, they received more than one lac applications.

(ii) After scrutiny, more than 45000 eligible candidates were called for written test and those who qualified the test were shortlisted for interview.

(iii) The interviews were conducted by properly constituted Selection Board. Merit list of only those candidates was prepared who qualified/passed the written test and interview. Selection of the suitable candidates was approved by the Competent Authority entirely based on merit against the available vacancies by observing the regional / provincial quota as prescribed by Federal Government.

(iv) Malik M. Akram S/o Malik M. Ibrahim from Multan had also applied against the post of Assistant. He passed the written test but he was not found suitable by the Selection Board. Therefore, his case could not be processed further.

(v) It is also confirmed by PIAC that they have not selected any such candidate who has not been found suitable by the Selection Board.

7. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan in his oral statement said that injustice has been done as candidates having lower marks than Malik M. Akram have been selected. Mr. Nadeem Khan Yousafzai, Managing Director, PIA, said that 60 marks were set for written test and 40 for interview. The candidate could not secure required marks in the interview. In reply to a query raised by Senator Syeda Sughra Imam that test should be job specific, Maj. Gen. (R) Mir Haider Ali Khan, Acting Secretary, Ministry of Defence, vowed that new criteria for selection would be introduced wherein the test and interview would be job specific.

8. After detailed discussion the Committee recommends that recruitment process should be made transparent and should be job specific.

9. With the above said direction the Committee disposes of the matter.

(MEHBOOB ALI)
AS /Secretary Committee

(SENATOR SYED TAHIR HUSSAIN MASHHADI)
Chairman