



SENATE OF PAKISTAN



REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

**For the Period from
12th November 2009 to 12th July, 2010**

Presented by
Senator S. M. ZAFAR
Chairman



SENATE OF PAKISTAN

**REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE
ON EDUCATION**

**For the Period from
12th November 2009 to 12th July, 2010**

Presented by
Senator S. M. ZAFAR
Chairman

CONTENTS

<u>Description</u>	<u>Page</u>
* From the Desk of Chairman Senate Standing Committee on Education.....	3-6
* Executive Summary.....	7-9
* Profiles.....	10-24
* Minutes of the Meetings.....	25-108

FROM THE DESK OF CHAIRMAN SENATE
STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

Since the Committee was constituted on 15-10-2009 after a considerable delay, The Committee in its various meetings took up the following issues and made some significant recommendations:-

- i. Existing security arrangements at the educational institutions of the country.
 - ii. Existing state of libraries in the country and promotion of reading culture.
 - iii. Education Policy – 2009.
 - iv. Plight of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored by HEC to study medicine in Cuba.
 - v. Strengthening of distant learning.
 - vi. Promulgation of National Library Foundation Act – 2009 and National Library Act – 2010.
 - vii. Comprehensive legislation in line with Article 25A of the Constitution.
2. Before indicating salient points of these suggestions and recommendations that were formulated in these meetings, I want to put on record that the requisite focus and concern for education is *regrettably missing* at every level in the country at the federal, provincial and local governments and even the civil society.
3. In the last 62 years, education has been given the lowest priority both in terms of budget allocation and utilization of meager amount given to this sector. HEC which worked satisfactorily in the past is now facing financial constraints and a number of projects already undertaken by the HEC are likely to be closed down.

‘There seems to be an absence of realization and *lack of any political will to meet the challenge.*’

4. In selecting the subjects for discussion and recommendation, the Standing Committee decided that Libraries play important role in promotion of reading culture and help research in various fields. Accordingly in one of its meetings, it recommended to the federal government for the framing and promulgation of National Library Foundation Act and National Library Act. The drafts of these two statues were also forwarded to the Government of Pakistan.

‘I regret to add that no action has been taken in this regard.’

5. As the Government had announced its Education Policy of 2009, the Committee examined it in detail and found it *inadequate* to meet the needs of the time. The allocation of budget was found to be insufficient and disheartening, the Committee is of the view that the Government should have gone on austerity and reduce its expenditure in other fields which could be diverted to the education sector.

‘I regret to add that these recommendations felt on deaf ears and instead of enhancing the educational budget there has been an enormous and unfortunate reduction.’

6. Since a new Article (25-A) has been added which provides for compulsory and free education to be given by the State to every citizen between the ages of 5-16, the Committee promptly undertook the need for a comprehensive legislation so that the constitutional requirements as well as an educated Pakistan is made possible. A Sub-Committee is working and drafting this legislation in consultation with the relevant authorities, it may be added that provincial governments were also invited to give their input. As soon as these laws are formulated, they will be transmitted to the federal and provincial governments for taking advantage of the same and to make laws in their respective jurisdiction.

'I only hope that the efforts of the Committee will be met with equal promptness.'

7. The Committee took suo-moto notice of the complaint of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored by HEC to study medicine in Cuba. The Committee held number of meetings, formally and informally, and I was able to send one member delegation consisting of Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar to Cuba who ably and effectively negotiated with the Cuban authorities. On receipt of her report, I held meetings with Chairman, HEC and the then Ambassador of Cuba and the Committee succeeded in inclusion of the medical education being imparted to the Pakistani students in Cuba in ELAM (Latin American School of Medical Sciences) which is duly verified and accepted by WHO. Unfortunately the 15 students were repatriated by the Government of Cuba supposedly for their activities not confirming to the Cuban laws. On the intervention of the Committee, the Prime Minister has ordered that these 15 students may be accommodated in medical colleges in Pakistan.

8. I shall like to add on my behalf and on behalf of the Committee our gratitude to the Cuban government for the generous offer they had made to provide free medical education to 1000 Pakistani students and to have accommodated some of the requests made by the Committee for further facilities to the Pakistani students now studying in their country. It gives me pleasure to add that all the 985 students now studying in Cuba are very satisfied of the system of education in Cuba and the additional facilities provided both by the Cuban government and PMDC. The information received by me from the Cuban authorities is that Pakistani students are doing fine and better than students from other countries.

'I am looking forward for the return of these qualified doctors from Cuba who I am sure will be bringing not only the proficiency in their medical learning but also passion to help the humanity.'

9. I would like to mention yet another important recommendations made by the Committee which relates to security arrangements at the educational institutions of the country, particularly in view of the growing terrorist activities which have targeted educational institutions. As there is a Parliamentary Committee on National Security constituted by the Speaker of the National Assembly, it will be appropriate that the Chairman of the Committee takes notice of the recommendations of the Education Committee vis-à-vis the security arrangements at the educational institutions of the country.

10. I deeply appreciate the contribution made by Mr. Abdul Sami Khan, Secretary Committee who helped me in selecting and preparing the agenda of the Committee. He faithfully recorded the views of the participants in preparing the minutes. I will also like to add the contribution made by my Private Secretary and Personal Assistant for arranging the Committee meetings.

Sincerely,
Sd/-
(S.M. ZAFAR)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Senate Standing Committee on Education during the period from 12th November, 2009 to 12th July, 2010 held ten (11) meetings. During these meetings the Committee took up various issues falling under its ambit as laid down in Rule 140 (2) of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Senate, 1988 and formulated recommendations to resolve the issues.

2. A few important issues taken up by the Standing Committee and the recommendations made by it are enumerated as under:-

- i. In view of the deteriorating law and order situation the Committee in its meeting held on 12th November, 2009 reviewed the existing security arrangements at the educational institutions in the country and suggested measures to make the security system in and around educational institutions in the country invincible.
- ii. The Committee in its meeting held on 16th December, 2009 took stock of existing state of libraries and also deliberated on the necessity to legislate for maintaining/up-gradation of existing libraries in the country. Taking due cognizance of the fact that there exists a very significant co-relation between reading habits of a nation and its progress and prosperity and also of the fact that after sixty two years of existence of the country and mushroom growth of its population the existing numbers of libraries in Pakistan are insufficient and as such are not catering for its students, disabled and senior citizens the Committee formulated recommendations to be implemented by the Ministry of Education to promote library culture in Pakistan.
- iii. The Committee in its held on 7th January, 2010 discussed at length Education Policy – 2009. The Committee unanimously held the view that education in Pakistan is not being given its due importance. In view of the urgent need to bring vibrancy in

education sector and to exploit latent talent of youth of this country the committee made recommendations to bring improvements in the National Education Policy – 2009. The Committee inter-alia recommended that atleast 4% of GDP should be invested in education.

- iv. The Committee in its meeting held on 8th February, 2010 took up the issue regarding plight of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored by Higher Education Commission (HEC) to study medicine in Cuba. There had been a growing restlessness among the students regarding the quality of medical education being imparted to them, lack of basic facilities like laboratory, library and dissection facilities etc. which are a prerequisite for acquiring a medical degree. The Committee vigorously pursued the matter at various fora and was successful in inclusion of the medical education being imparted to the Pakistani students in Cuba in the ELAM (Latin American School of Medical Sciences), a system of medical education in Cuba which provides its students with better facilities and is certified by WHO. In addition to this the Committee by dint of its efforts was also successful in getting referred by Prime Minister to HEC the case of fifteen (15) medical students who were repatriated by the Government of Cuba allegedly for their activities not conforming to the Cuban laws. The HEC has been requested to accommodate these fifteen (15) students in medical colleges in Pakistan.
- v. The Committee in its meeting held on 9th March, 2010 discussed the status of promulgation of National Library Foundation Act as envisaged in National Education Policy, 2009. The Committee was informed that the Act is under consideration of the Ministry of Education. In addition to this the Committee unanimously endorsed the necessity of promulgation of National Library Act, 2010 and

recommended to the Ministry of Education to initiate a bill of National Library Act, 2010 on priority basis.

- vi. The Committee in its meeting held on 27th May, 2010 took a detailed briefing on charter, structure, performance and achievements of Allama Iqbal Open University during the year 2009-10 and made recommendations for strengthening of the system of distant learning.
- vii. The Committee in its meeting held on 12th July, 2010 discussed at length the need and importance of comprehensive legislation in line with Article 25A of the Constitution wherein free and compulsory education has been recognized as a constitutional right of the children of the age of 5 to 16 years. The Committee constituted a Sub-Committee for a report on the subject issue within three months.

PROFILE OF THE SENATORS

Senators

S. M. Zafar.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PML
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9223825, 042-5420828, 5421668
Office Phone: 051-9223969, 042-5781986-87
Mobile Phone: 0300-8455377
Fax: 042-5781988
Email: mnz@nexlinx.net.pk
Province: Punjab
Address: i. G-302, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. 401-Siddique Trade Centre, 72, Mian Boulevard, Gulberg, Lahore.

Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education (**Chairman Committee**)
Standing Committee on Law, Justice and Human Rights and Parliamentary Affairs
Functional Committee on Human Rights
Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs and Kashmir Affairs and Gilgit Baltistan
Standing Committee on Minorities Affairs

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: B.A.L.L.B
Senior Advocate Supreme Court of Pakistan

Federal Minister for Law and Parliamentary Affairs, Government of Pakistan(1965-69)
President High Court Bar Association, Lahore(1975)
President Supreme Court Bar Association(1976)
Chairman Human Right Society of Pakistan.
Chairman Cultural Association of Pakistan.

Senators

Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: MQM
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9202697, 021-2627307
Mobile Phone: 0300-2548581
Province: Sindh
Address: i. F-409, Parliament Lodges Islamabad.
ii. Flat No.6, Paracha Mansion, Burns Road, Karachi.

Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Religious Affairs and Zakat and Ushr
Standing Committee on Railways
Standing Committee on Culture and Tourism
Standing Committee on Housing and Works

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: * Ph.D. Faculty of Usul-AIDin, Azhar University, Cairo, Egypt.
* M.A. in Dawat-i-Islam with thesis, Azhar University, Cairo, Egypt.
* Shahadat-ul-Alamia, (M.A. Islamic Studies - Arabic), Ashrafia University Lahore, Pakistan.

* Ex. Professor Al Azhar University, Cairo Egypt from 1983 to 1998.
* Visiting Professor University of Karachi, Since Jan 01, 2004.
* Special Scholarship by President of Pakistan from 1982-1983.
* Scholarship From Al-Azhar University Egypt 1978-1982.
* Nishan-e-Ilm-o-Danish Karachi University.

Senators

Mrs. Farah Aqil.

Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: ANP
Gender: Female
Home Phone: 091-5270182, 5274304
Mobile Phone: 0301-8593029
Province: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Address: E-402, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.



Committee(s): Standing Committee on Women Development
Standing Committee on Railways
Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Culture and Tourism
Standing Committee on Social Welfare and Special Education

Details: Tenure = March 2009 to March 2015

Achievements: M.A. Psychology

MPA (ANP) 2002-2001
APWA Peshawar a.sec.2006-2008
Legislative Watch Group (Aurat Foundation) Member 2005-2008
Hamdard Shooraa Group warden (Ladies wing) pf civil defense 2006-2008

Senators

Hafiz Rashid Ahmed.

Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: IND
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9207126
Office Phone: 051-9223976
Mobile Phone: 0300-5854378, 0342-5100078
Province: FATA
Address: 110-H, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.



Committee(s): Functional Committee on Human Rights
Standing Committee on States and Frontier Regions (**Chairman Committee**)
Standing Committee on Postal Services
Standing Committee on Education
Functional Committee on Government Assurances

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Senators

Maulana Gul Naseeb Khan.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: JUI-F
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9206566, 0936-761368
Mobile Phone: 0333-9120552
Email: marjan158@hotmail.com
Province: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Address: i. A-006, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. Village Laram P.O Koti Gram Teh. Adeenzai Distt. Dir Lower.

Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Water and Power
Standing Committee on Railways (**Chairman Committee**)
Standing Committee on Sports and Youth Affairs
Standing Committee on Postal Services

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: M.A. Islamiat.
Fazil Wafaq-ul-Madaris Arabia, Multan.
Fazil Jamia Imdad-ul-uloom, Peshawar.

Special Political Awards on:-

- 1.As Chief Election Commissioner JUI 2002.
- 2.As Chief Executive Dew-a-Band International Conference 2002.
- 3.As C.E. Tahafuz-e-Deeni Madaris.

Senators

Mir Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali.



Position: Dy. Chairman, Senate of Pakistan
Party Affiliation: PML
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9206861, 081-2837405
Mobile Phone: 0300-8383675
Fax: 051-9208418
Province: Balochistan
Address: H.No. 16, Minister Enclave, Islamabad.

Committee(s): Finance Committee
Standing Committee on Population Welfare
Standing Committee on Defence and Defence Production
Standing Committee on Information and Broadcasting
Standing Committee on Labour and Manpower
House Committee
Standing Committee on Education

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: B.A.
Chairman Municipal Usta Mohammad, Balochistan, 1983-1990.
Member Provincial Council Balochistan 1983-1985
Member Provincial Assembly, Balochistan, 1988-1993
Provincial Minister of Balochistan, 1991-1993
Chief Minister of Balochistan, 1998-1999

Senators

Begum Najma Hameed.

Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PML-N
Gender: Female
Mobile Phone: 0300-5117531
Province: Punjab
Address: i. H-07, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. 26-R, Model Town Ext., Lahore.



Committee(s): Standing Committee on Women Development
Standing Committee on Cabinet Secretariat, Inter Provincial Coordination and Special Initiatives
Standing Committee on Narcotics Control
Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Interior

Details: Tenure = March 2009 to March 2015

Senators

Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar.

Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PML
Gender: Female
Home Phone: 051-9210563
Office Phone: 051-9266997
Mobile Phone: 0300-8559043
Fax: 051-9205702
Province: Punjab
Address: House No. 163, Street. 18, F-10/2, Islamabad.



Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Women Development
Standing Committee on Culture and Tourism (**Chairperson Committee**)
Standing Committee on Minorities Affairs
Standing Committee on Housing and Works

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: Masters Public Administration Carnegie Mellon, Pittsburgh, USA (1986)
Graduation Bachelor of Arts Punjab University (1976)
Diploma Hotel Management and Tourism Institute of Hotel & Tourism Management, Salzburg, Austria (1977)
Diploma Hotel Management Cornell University, New York, USA (1977)

Nilofar Bakhtiar is a renowned social and political activist with thirty years of experience, national and international, and commands leadership of the poor and marginalized communities. She has, during the past three decades, devoted herself to the cause of gender justice and empowerment and has earned a place for herself at the highest forums of civil society and governance. She has given leadership and direction to grass root communities and has enabled them to articulate their voices and ensure visibility. Presently she is an elected member of the Senate (Upper House of the Parliament of Pakistan), and works to promote legislation and policy that is pro-poor and gender sensitive. As a senior member of the Federal Cabinet, Nilofar Bakhtiar has worked extensively on gender equality, violence against women and regional cooperation. People-centered development, democratic decentralization and issues of equity have been areas of major focus for her. She has hosted several national and international conferences including the UN conference on MDGs held in Islamabad. In addition, she has the honor of leading Pakistan at the United Nations, the Non-Aligned Conference, SAARC Women Ministers Conference and the SAARC Tourism Ministers Conference, among others.

A distinguished social and political activist from her student days, Nilofar Bakhtiar has been a member of the Pakistan Muslim League for the past twenty-five years. She has the honor of being one of the senior-most female members of the Party and rose up to the office of the founding member as well as the national president of the party's women wing. She distinguished herself by becoming the only female office bearer of her party who was persecuted for political activism and was sentenced to six months imprisonment for leading a national movement for the restoration of democracy in the country. Legislation on Honor Killing in Pakistan in 2003, is one example among many of her untiring commitments to the cause of gender justice.

Begum Hafeeza Ali Malik, mother of Nilofar Bakhtiar, was a renowned social worker, and was also the founder and chairperson of The National Committee for the Repatriation of Prisoners of War after the 1971 war. In this regard, she led the delegation sent to United Nations and to several other countries, and met with various heads of state, politicians

and the Pope in Italy.

With a strong family background in social work and community service, she joined Lions Clubs International in 1984 and rose to top positions nationally. She is a pioneer of several primary schools, blood banks, book banks and Women Development Centers. Her main thrust of work has been on the uplift of women, health and educational projects all over the country e.g. Prevention of Diabetic Blindness Centre at Al-Shifa Eye Hospital, Rawalpindi. In 1999 she made history at San Diego, USA, and became the first woman in 84 years, to be elected to serve on the Club's International Board of Directors, responsible for overseeing welfare activities in 57 countries throughout Africa, South Asia, and the Middle East. During her tenure as a Director of the world's largest welfare organization, Bosnia, Somalia, Bangladesh, Afghanistan, Iran, Africa and the Middle East were areas of particular focus for relief activities by Lions Club International. Nilofar Bakhtiar is known for her communication skills in English & Urdu and is one of the most sought after public figures in Pakistan by the print & electronic media. Moreover, she has the honor of being invited to speak at various national and international forums such as the European Forum Alpbach, Austria, Ni Putes Ni Soumises, France, APNA Doctors Association, USA.

Political Career:

Her interest in politics started early during her school days when she won elections school captain and then moved on to become the President of the College Student Union. She also became the Course President Studying Hotel Management in Austria. After that, she was actively involved in numerous campaigns for the restoration of democracy in the country. She participated in open debates/seminars and headed several rallies to that effect.

She joined Pakistan Muslim League in 1990 and was elected as a member of the Municipal Corporation, Rawalpindi. Later, she organized and rallied women for election campaigns in 1990, 1993, 1997 and 2002. She is one of the rare female members of the political arena who were jailed during the restoration of democracy for a period of several months.

She has held the following offices in the Federal Cabinet, Government of Pakistan:

* Advisor to the Prime Minister and Minister In-charge, Women Development, Special Education and Social Welfare (2002-2006)

* Minister for Tourism (2006-2007)

Bakhtiar is currently elected as a Senator, Government of Pakistan, for a six-year term (2006-2012)

Conferences Attended:

- * Guest Speaker at Lions Clubs Conferences & Conventions in Australia, America, Canada, India, Sri Lanka, Nepal, Bangladesh, Middle East, England, Sweden, Norway, Japan, Thailand, South Africa, Kenya
- * SAARC Conference on the Development of Women in India
- * UN sponsored "Beijing + 5" Conference on Women in 1995 in China.
- * World NGO Conference at UN Headquarters New York, USA 1995.
- * Headed the Women Sports national contingent to Iran during the Asian Games
- * Attended the 47th, 48th and 49th sessions of the UN Commission on the Status of Women, New York, 2003-2005
- * UNIFEM Conference in Bhutan
- * Hosted the 5th South Asia Regional Ministerial Conference of the SAARC Countries at Islamabad, May 2005
- * NAM Conference held at Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, May 2005
- * ECOSOC Ministerial Roundtable Conference at the UN Headquarters, New York, 2005
- * SAARC Tourism Ministers Conference in Bangladesh, 2006
- * Represented the country at five international Tourism Fairs during 2006-2007 at Berlin, Delhi, New York, Paris and London
- * World Tourism Organization (WTO) Ministerial Conference, Azerbaijan, 2006
- * Hosted the World Tourism Organization (WTO) conference at Islamabad, 2007
- * Chaired the WTO Conference on World Tourism Day, titled "Tourism Opens Doors For Women," Sri Lanka, September 2007

Awards and Honors:

- * Several time gold medalist in debating competitions
- * Awarded a USAID scholarship for Masters at Carnegie Mellon, Pittsburgh
- * Visited the United States on invitation from the US Government to observe primary elections in 2000
- * Bolan, Mussawar, U.N., Citizen and several other awards for social work and humanitarian services
- * Several Lions Leadership and presidential Awards, including the highest honours bestowed by the association
- * First woman to receive the "Ambassador of Goodwill Award" by Lions Clubs International.
- * She is also on the board of several educational institutions and welfare centers, including Fatima Jinnah Women University, OPF Girls College, National Fund for Culture & Heritage, Film Censor Board
- * Woman of the Year Award in 2004 by Star Awards
- * Invited to celebrate the International Women's Day, 8th March, as a state guest in Berlin, Germany
- * Visited China on the invitation of All China Women's Federation
- * Visited Paris on the invitation of local community in Paris
- * Women's Achievement Award, a recognition by the Print and Electronic Media Association of India, 2007
- * Currently serving as Vice President of Al-Shifa Trust Eye Hospital, Rawalpindi
- * Currently serving as Chairperson, NGO Bardaasht (Tolerance)
- * Special Advisor to the World Tourism Organization (WTO) on Gender and Tourism.
- * Member of World Steering Committee for Women Development by United Nations Fund for the advancement of Women (UNIFEM)
- * Standing Committee on Culture and Tourism (Chairperson Committee)
- * Standing Committee on Education
- * Standing Committee on Women Development
- * Standing Committee on Minorities Affairs
- * Standing Committee on Housing and Works
- * Served as Vice Chairperson Pakistan Red Crescent for two terms and now serving as Chairperson Pak Red Crescent since November, 2009.

Senators

Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: JIP
Gender: Male
Home Phone: 051-9207477-Ext.443, 0928-611792
Mobile Phone: 0333-9102413, 0303-6917026
Fax: 0928-612574
Email: muhammadibrahimk5@gmail.com
Province: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Address: i. H.No.002, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. Village Hinjal Amir Khan Tehsil and District Bannu.

Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Privatization
Standing Committee on Railways
Standing Committee on States and Frontier Regions
Standing Committee on Law, Justice and Human Rights and Parliamentary Affairs

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Achievements: M.A. (Journalism)
M.A. (Political Science)
L.L.B.
Lecturer in Journalism from 1982 to 1985.

Secretary General Jamaat e Islami NWFP 1985-1994
Amir Jamaat e Islami NWFP 1994-2003
Naib Amir Jamaat e Islami Pakistan 2004 till date.

Senators

Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch.

Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PML
Gender: Female
Home Phone: 051-9207477, 081-2445777
Mobile Phone: 0300-3833394
Province: Balochistan
Address: i. C-410, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. Awan-e-Kalat, Sariab Road, Quetta.



Committee(s): Standing Committee on Education
Standing Committee on Overseas Pakistanis
Standing Committee on Health
Standing Committee on Culture and Tourism
Standing Committee on Cabinet Secretariat, Inter Provincial Coordination and Special Initiatives

Details: Tenure = March 2006 to March 2012

Senators

Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PPP-P
Gender: Female
Home Phone: 051-4437258
Mobile Phone: 0300-5220063
Address: H.No.525, St-33, I-8/2, Islamabad.

Committee(s): Standing Committee on Housing and Works
Standing Committee on Cabinet Secretariat, Inter Provincial Coordination and Special Initiatives
Standing Committee on Education
Functional Committee on Human Rights
Standing Committee on Women Development

Details: Tenure = March 2009 to March 2015

Achievements: Ph.D.
Education (Teaching), Lecturer Govt College Mardan: (1970-1972)
Lecturer Federal Govt. College for Women, F-7/2, Islamabad: (1973-1980)
Assistant Professor, Federal Govt. College for Women, F-7/2, Islamabad: (1980-1990)
Associate Professor, Federal Govt. College for Women, F-7/2, Islamabad: (1980-2002)
Pakistan Peoples Party: (2002-To date)
General Secretary Women Wing Distt. Islamabad: (2002-to date)

Senators

Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin.



Position: Senator
Party Affiliation: PPPP
Gender: Female
Home Phone: 081-2441882
Mobile Phone: 0300-3887714
Fax: 081-2441882
Province: Balochistan
Address: i. H-12, Parliament Lodges, Islamabad.
ii. H.No.215-J, Block No.4, Satellite Town, Quetta.

Committee(s): Functional Committee on Government Assurances
Standing Committee on Social Welfare and Special Education
Standing Committee on Women Development
Standing Committee on Education
Functional Committee on Human Rights

Details: Tenure = March 2009 to March 2015

Achievements: M.A. M.Ed. L.L.B
Principal Zeb Public School: (1992-onwards).
Pakistan Peoples Party: (1975-onwards)
Pakistan peoples Party Balochistan: (Provincial Information Secretary: 1985-onwards)

COMMITTEE MEETINGS

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 7TH JANUARY, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 7th January, 2010 at 2.30 p.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - i. Briefing on the National Education Policy 2009.
 - ii. Any other item with the permission of chair.

3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-

1.	Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal	Member
2.	Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin	Member
3.	Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil	Member
4.	Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan	Member
5.	Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali	Member
6.	Senator Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch	Member
7.	Senator Begum Najma Hameed	Member

4. A list of officers of Ministry of Education, Higher Education Commission, Department of Education, Govt. of Sindh, International Islamic University and PEIRA who attended the meeting is annexed.

5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman elucidating the significance of the agenda before the Committee expressed his concern regarding non-presence of Minister for Education in the meeting. He held the view that the non-attendance of Minister for Education in the meeting manifest that education is not the priority of the present government. As such he inquired

from the Secretary Education the reasons of his absence from the meeting. Responding to the query the Secretary Education informed the Committee that the Minister for Education did not turn up in the meeting as he himself could not confirm from him his availability for the meeting as such the onus of his absence lies with him. He also supplemented his explanation with the fact that most probably he had not yet taken the oath of his new portfolio, he may, therefore, have felt not desirable to attend the meeting. The explanation offered by the Secretary Education was duly accepted by the Committee. Nevertheless, the honourable Chairman did request the Secretary Education to convey to the Minister for Education the deep concern of the Committee for his non-attendance in the meeting and also exhorted the Secretary Education to obviate the possibility of recurrence of such situation in future.

6. The honourable Chairman referring to the famous proverb that **“Knowledge is Power”** expressed his deep apprehension that this power of our beloved country is eroding at a fast pace. The government is not paying due attention and allocating resources to education sector to strengthen this power. Tracing back the history regarding educational development in the country he highlighted the fact that very rosy policies were framed in the past but the ground realities regarding educational improvements in the country portray a very gloomy and depressing picture. Against this perspective the country does not require simply bright vision, the educationists in the country should pay more heed and emphasis on how to achieve the bright vision normally conceived in the education policies. As such he held the view that the today’s discussion on the **“Education Policy, 2009” would not be focused on its vision but on the means to achieve that vision. He, would, therefore, request the participants to apprise the Committee with the measures and means to accomplish the vision embodied in the Education Policy, 2009.**

7. Against above backdrop the honourable Chairman also brought to the notice of the participants that Pakistan is awfully lacking in the field of

education internationally as well as regionally. Even after sixty two years, of its existence Pakistan has not been able to establish any university which could compete with other universities both internationally and regionally. The most disturbing aspect of this scenario is that even Bangladesh is far ahead of Pakistan in the education sector. The honourable Chairman emphasized the dire need to give priority to education sector, the improvement of which is vital for development, prosperity and strengthening of the nation. He also informed the participants that on the basis of his long association with the education sector he can state with deep commitment that Pakistan is not short of any talent. The youths of the country are highly intelligent and industrious. There is an urgent need to bring vibrancy in the education sector to exploit the latent talents of the youths of this country. The youths of this country are suffering adversely because of lack of opportunities. Against this backdrop he also expressed his concern regarding substantial curtailment of the budgetary allocation of the Higher Education Commission and expressed his apprehension regarding optimum utilization of the resources allocated for education in the Kerry Lugar Bill. He requested Secretary Education to apprise the Committee with the ways and means to achieve the vision formulated in the Education Policy, 2009 by Ministry of Education.

8. The Secretary Education comprehensively endorsed the views/comments expressed by honourable Chairman. He, however, expressed his optimism regarding improvement in education as there is now visible determination to bring improvement in education sector among the persons responsible for framing educational policies and those responsible for their execution. He informed the Committee that there is a growing apprehension in the government circles regarding mushroom growth of Private Education Sector in the country. The apprehension is compounded by the fact that the services being provided by the private sector in education sector cannot match with those provided by the public sector as these are well thought out and devoid of any profit motives.

9. Nevertheless, he informed the Committee that Ministry of Education is mandated for imparting education up to class twelve (12). The executive authority of the Ministry is restricted only to Islamabad Capital Territory. The provincial Education Departments having a fairly wide provincial administrative network play 95% of the role in implementation of policies on education. Thus the National Education Policy, 2009 has been prepared by the Ministry of Education after intensive consultations with the Provincial Governments spanning over a period of four years. He listed the salient features of the policy as under:-

i. **Literacy**

- 86% Literacy by 2015
- Minimum 4% of education budget for Literacy and Non Formal Basic Education

ii. **Universal Primary Education (UPE)**

Universal and free primary education by 2015 and upto class 10 by 2025

iii. **Higher Education**

Enrolment to rise from existing 4.7% to 10% by 2015 and 15% by 2020

iv. **Quality of Education**

Improvement in teachers qualifications, curriculum, textbooks, assessment/examination, learning environment etc.

v. **Technical and Vocational Education (TVE)**

TVE shall be promoted and made more relevant

vi. **Islamic Education**

Islamiyat compulsory subject from Grade 1 to BA/BSc

vii. **Resources for Education**

UPto 7% of GDP allocations for Education by 2015

viii. **Governance**

Clearly defined Federal, Provincial and District roles and responsibilities.

10. To a query of the honourable Chairman the Secretary Education informed that there is a little room for failure of the National Education Policy, 2009 as the implementation of the policy will not be restricted to the bureaucratic levels. Its implementation will be periodically reviewed and monitored in an Inter-ministerial forum.

11. The Member, HEC informed the Committee that the issues in the education sector are of very serious nature and needs to be attended to on priority basis as they relate to the future of young generation. The persons responsible in the past and in the present for framing policies on education are responsible for its persistent degeneration. The meetings on education are held only to give lip service to the issues. The decisions are made but are never implemented. The provision of adequate funds is the corner stone of any successful education policy and this aspect had been conveniently ignored by the Government. As such there is a dire need to allocate adequate resources to the education sector and deep commitment of the government to bring improvements in it. The ratio of GDP to be invested in education needs to be enhanced significantly to bring in improvements. To a query of the honourable Chairman the Member, HEC informed that following five universities have been ranked in the 600 best universities of the world:-

- i. NUST
- ii. UET, Lahore
- iii. Quaid-e-Azam University
- iv. University of Lahore
- v. University of Karachi

12. The honourable Chairman held the view that the above mentioned numbers of Pakistani universities is not encouraging. There is lot of room for further improvement and as such HEC should gear up efforts to increase the number.

13. After intensive discussion on the National Education Policy, 2009 explained by the Secretary Education and Joint Education Advisor the Committee made following recommendations:-

- i. Incentive should be provided to the teachers for serving in the remote areas of the provinces.
- ii. There should be a uniform curriculum in all schools of the country.
- iii. The teachers responsible for teaching English should be intensively trained in the language.
- iv. Reading culture should be promoted in the country.
- v. The teachers in the schools should also be entrusted with the responsibility of determining aptitude of the students.
- vi. Culture awareness should be cultivated among the students.
- vii. The number of subjects in schools should be reduced and the quality of education should be improved.
- viii. Model schools in Islamabad should be made a role model for other schools in the country.
- ix. Emphasizes should be given on in-service training.
- x. The Federal Government should train master trainers for imparting training in the provinces.
- xi. Atleast 4% GDP should be invested in education.
- xii. Culture issues and removal of literacy should be addressed in the light of Article 31 and 37(b) of the Constitution.
- xiii. A comprehensive report should be obtained from Ministry of Finance regarding allocation/release of funds to Ministry of Education for the current fiscal year 2009-10 and presented to the Committee in its next meeting.
- xiv. Degree colleges should be upgraded to the universities and education upto class 12 should be imparted at school level.

14. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - **MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SUB-COMMITTEE OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 7TH JUNE, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD**

A meeting of the Sub-Committee of Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 7th June, 2010 at 11:30 a.m. in the Committee Room No. 3, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Convenership of Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - i. To discuss and finalize relocation of fifteen (15) Pakistani students in medical colleges in Pakistan, repatriated by the Cuban Government.
 - ii. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Sub-Committee attended the meeting:-
 - i. Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali
 - ii. Senator Begum Najma Hameed
4. A list of officers of Higher Education Commission (HEC) and Pakistan Medical and Dental Council (PMDC) who attended the meeting is annexed.
5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by honourable Senator Begum Najma Hameed. Thereafter, the honourable Convener welcomed all the participants to the meeting. She informed the Committee that the Government of Cuba deeply moved by the catastrophe

caused by the devastating earthquake in October, 2005 had offered to the Government of Pakistan a scholarship programme of medical education for 1000 Pakistani students. Accordingly, about 1000 Pakistani students after following a laid down selection process were sent to Cuba for medical education. She recapitulated in brief various difficulties confronted by the Pakistani students in Cuba. The issues/problems of these Pakistani students related to standard of education in Cuba, recognition of their degrees by PMDC, lack of facilities necessary for medical education and various other social and cultural issues. The Government of Pakistan in order to settle these issues sent delegations to Cuba. The honourable Convener was also a part of one such delegation sent to Cuba to sort out the issues being faced by the Pakistani students in Cuba. She narrated briefly the problems faced by the Pakistani students in Cuba and her efforts to resolve them. Despite the visit of the first delegation to Cuba the problems of students kept on mounting and ultimately the students went on a strike the Government of Cuba repatriated fifteen (15) Pakistani students who they considered were the ring leaders involved in instigating the students in making unjustified demands and polluting the educational environment. Against this perspective she informed the Committee that the main objective now of convening a meeting of the Sub-Committee is to find out ways and means for relocation of these fifteen (15) students who have been repatriated by the Government of Cuba. She informed the Committee that the fifteen students repatriated by the Government of Cuba are exceedingly bright and some of them are totally innocent there is no clear cut evidence regarding their involvement in an any activity in conflict with the Cuban laws. These students have already spent precious three years of their life to seek medical education in Cuba. As such there is dire need for their relocation either in Cuba or in Medical Colleges in public/private sector in Pakistan so that their future is secured. She informed the Committee that she is intimately familiar with these students. They are undergoing acute mental agony and trauma and in case we failed to secure their future, these students would be doomed. She held the view that the issue chiefly

pertains to Higher Education Commission (HEC) and as such she solicited the views of Executive Director, HEC on the subject issue.

6. The Executive Director, HEC informed the Committee that approximately 1000 students were sent to Cuba under a project conceived by the Government of Pakistan. The scholarships were awarded by the Government of Cuba and HEC was designated to evolve a mechanism for the selection process and to monitor the project. The HEC had all along been looking after the interest of these students after their departure from Pakistan. However, the Government of Cuba repatriated fifteen (15) students and cancelled their scholarships for their alleged involvement in activities prejudicial to their educational system and law of the land. As per HEC rules the students who are expelled from an institute on disciplinary grounds are required to reimburse all the expenditure made on them. However, HEC keeping a soft corner for these students has neither as yet initiated any action in this context nor have notified the repatriation of the students on disciplinary by the Government of Cuba. The officer informed that as such he is apprehensive that HEC may have to confront an audit objection on this account. Furthermore, the officer informed that any out of way favour to these students in all likelihood would create a bad precedent and would also pose an unmanageable position for HEC who are already flooded with similar cases. He also proposed to the Convener that instead of focusing on these students the Committee should also take due cognizance of the remaining students undergoing medical education in Cuba and also those studying in Pakistan.

7. The Executive Director, HEC also expressed his apprehensions regarding relocation of these fifteen (15) students in the medical institutes in Pakistan. He held the view that these students have spent three years studying medicine in a particular system in Cuba. On the basis of his experience when the students are taken from one system and are put to an entirely different system invariably results in creating a host of problems for the students. As such

the Committee should explore the possibility of accommodating these students in any other Latin American country where the medical education system is identical with that of Cuba. These students may be preferably accommodated in those countries. He also suggested that efforts may also be made to convince the Government of Cuba for taking back these students on humanitarian grounds. He proposed to the Convener that a way out with the Government of Cuba may be figured out and subsequently the financial implications can be worked out and settled. Alternately, the students may be accommodated in Medical Colleges in private sector in Pakistan. However, the students will have to start afresh as they had been educated in a different system.

8. Different proposals were made by the officers of PMDC who had also been part of a delegation sent by Government of Pakistan to Cuba. The proposal centered around provision of Karz-i-Hasna to students to enable them to finance their studies in Pakistan and seeking assistance from Dr. Owais of K.E. Medical College, Lahore, a renowned Pediatrician, who has excellent relations with the Government of Cuba for re-settlement of the students in Cuba.

9. The President, Pakistan Medical and Dental Council (PMDC) informed the Committee that so far he has not received any notification from the HEC regarding repatriation of fifteen (15) students by the Government of Cuba. He, however, endorsed the viewpoint of ED, HEC that if a student is expelled from any institute/Medical College on disciplinary grounds and his expulsion is notified then as per rules such a student can not be granted admission in any institute/medical college. He informed the Committee that he had also been associated with the Government of Cuba on the subject issue. Based on his experience he is of the view that the Committee should drop the option of relocation of the students in Cuba or in any Latin American country and instead focus on their relocation in Pakistan. He made following proposals to the Committee:-

- i. The next session in medical colleges is due to start shortly as such they may be guaranteed admission in private medical colleges in Pakistan.
- ii. The province-wise distribution of fifteen students is as under:-

Punjab	8
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	5
Sindh	1
Baluchistan	1
Total	<u>15</u>

The students may be accommodated in private medical colleges in their respective provinces.

- iii. The total estimated expenditure of the medical education of the fifteen (15) students amounts to Rs. 1.5 crore. The PMDC would arrange Rs. 0.75 million. The remaining 50% of the expenditure may be arranged from other sources.

10. The honourable Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali also endorsed the proposal regarding relocation of the fifteen students in the medical colleges in Pakistan. He held the view that any further deliberations with the Government of Cuba will open a Pandora box. As such the students should be accommodated in the Pakistani medical colleges and the Committee would explore ways and means for providing financial assistance to the students.

11. After an intensive discussion the Committee recommended as under:-

- i. The Committee unanimously endorsed the viewpoint of President, PMDC for relocation of students in Medical Colleges in Pakistan. Concurrently, as a second option the Convener of Sub-Committee may continue in her efforts with Cuban Ambassador to secure acceptance of the students by that Government on self payment and without a scholarship.

- ii. The HEC would prepare a financial proposal on the following issues and submit the same to the honourable Convener of the Sub-Committee at the earliest:-
 - a. Expenses to be incurred on the relocation of fifteen (15) students in the private medical colleges in Pakistan and mechanism to generate these funds.
 - b. Follow up on recommendations of the delegation headed by Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar to ensure relief to the remaining students including enhancement of stipends plus air tickets etc.
 - c. Expenditure for arranging coaching classes for the fifteen students to enable them to prepare for entry tests to secure admission in the Pakistani medical colleges and the mechanism to generate funds for the purpose.
12. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR MRS. NILOFAR BAKHTIAR)
Convener

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 8TH FEBRUARY, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD

A requisitioned meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 8th February, 2010 at 2:00 p.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - i. To discuss the plight of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored by HEC to study medicine in Cuba.
 - ii. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-
 1. Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal
 2. Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin
 3. Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil
 4. Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali
 5. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar
 8. Senator Begum Najma Hameed
4. Dr. Javiad R. Laghari, Chairman, HEC attended the meeting as Special Invitee. A list of officers of Ministries of Education and Foreign Affairs, Higher Education Commission (HEC) and Pakistan Medical & Dental Council (PMDC) who attended the meeting is annexed.
5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Begum Najma Hameed. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman expressed his gratitude to all the participants for attending the meeting despite their pre-occupations of very urgent and important nature. He informed the participants

that the instant meeting has been requisitioned with the objective to address plight of one thousand (1000) Pakistani students sent by Higher Education Commission (HEC) to Cuba for acquiring medical degrees. The issue has been dragging feet since long and over the period of time has become more complicated.

6. The honourable Chairman informed the Committee that the issue of the future of one thousand (1000) Pakistani students in Cuba was also earlier taken up by the Standing Committees of Senate and National Assembly but ostensibly the issue seems to be still in status quo. Since the issue had already been deliberated on different fora the honourable Chairman informed the Committee that as such he would not dilate on its historical background. This is all the more essential as there is an invariable tendency in political and bureaucratic meetings that instead of focusing on the resolution of the issues at hand unwanted indulgence is made in their historical background. Thus triggering a blame game and nitpicking. The solution of the issue is put on the back burner.

7. Explaining the issue in nutshell the honourable Chairman informed the Committee that Pakistan enjoys brotherly relations with the Government of Cuba. The Government of Cuba had always assisted Pakistan in difficult times. The services rendered by the Government of Cuba to Pakistan on the eve of devastating earthquake of 2005 would always be remembered by the people of Pakistan. The Government of Cuba moved by the catastrophe caused by the earthquake had offered to the Government of Pakistan a scholarship programme for medical education of 1000 Pakistani students. The basic concept behind the programme was to produce doctors hailing from the earthquake – hit areas who are familiar with terrain and trail of the region and also with the social and cultural milieu so that best possible medical services could be made available to the inhabitants of the regions/areas. However, the selection of the 932 students sent to Cuba was not made in accordance with the spirit of the offer made by the

Cuban Government. The students were selected from all the four provinces instead of making selection exclusively from the earthquake hit-areas.

8. The students sent to Cuba for the medical education have reported that the medical school in which they are being imparted education lacks basic facilities like laboratory, library and dissection facilities etc. which are a pre-requisite for acquiring a medical degree. The Pakistani students have been put in ALBA (Bolivarian Alliance for the Peoples of our America), a new programme designed to produce paramedics and not doctors. The school wherein the students are being imparted education is located in a Jungle, not conducive to learning and the movement of students is also restricted within the four walls of the school. It is also not included in the ELAM (Latin American School of Medical Sciences), a system of medical education in Cuba which provides its students with better facilities and is certified by WHO. After completion of their medical education they would be only awarded a certificate instead of a proper medical degree which is not recognized by Pakistan Medical and Dental Council (PMDC). As a sequel of all this there is a growing frustration among the students as well as their parents in Pakistan. The necessity of requisitioning a meeting of the Committee is an evidence that the problems of the Pakistani students in Cuba and anguish of their families in Pakistan is still persisting and efforts so far made to take the students out of woods have not borne fruit.

9. Against above perspective the honourable Chairman informed the Committee that since the prime objective of convening of the meeting is to focus on the resolution of the issue and to mitigate the reported sufferings of the students and their families, the Chairman, HEC would apprise the Committee with outcome of his meetings with the H.E. Cuban Ambassador on the subject issue and measures being taken by HEC to address the issue befittingly. However, prior to proceeding further the honourable Chairman requested Ex-Senator Raza Muhammad Raza to familiarize the participants with the ground

realities of the subject issue as he being father of one of the students had visited Cuba in a private capacity and is any eye witness to the entire circumstances.

10. Ex-Senator Raza Ahmed Raza whose son is also receiving medical education in Cuba alongwith other students expressed his gratitude to the honourable Chairman and the members of the Committee for having invited him for attending the meeting of the Committee. He held the view that Pakistani students in Cuba are undergoing miseries because of the negligence of HEC. The HEC did not take PMDC into confidence prior to sending the students to Cuba. The main objective behind the Cuban offer was to impart medical education only to students hailing from the earthquake affected areas. The HEC while selecting the students did not reflect this fact in its advertisement inviting applications from the students. The students sent to the Cuba were kept in dark. They were not briefed about the type and level of medical education they would be receiving in the Cuba. The students were kept under the fallacy that the Cuban Government after completion of six years medical education would award them with a medical degree, recognized by WHO. The students after reaching Cuba were taken by surprise as they were put to a different system of education, ALBA, designed to produce paramedics. HEC had promised to the students a stipend of \$100 per month which was supposed to increase by \$ 5 annually. Contrarily, the students are being paid a meager amount of Euro 50 only. He also pointed out that during the initial period of one year the students were paid only Euro 30. At the time of award of scholarship the total period of the medical education was stipulated as six years which has now been enhanced to seven years. The students had informed him that the Cuban Government have informed them that on the basis of medical education being imparted to them they cannot become qualified medical doctors. Consequently, there is a growing frustration among the students. In case appropriate action is not taken by the government of Pakistan for redressal of their grievances it is apprehended that their may occur a few incidents of suicide among the students. **The honourable**

Senator held the view that the plight of students can only be addressed if they are shifted to ELAM.

11. The honourable Senator further informed the Committee that in view of circumstances narrated above HEC promised to send a delegation to Cuba before 15th January, 2010. The promised delegation have not yet been able to visit the students reportedly because of lack of funds. To ascertain the exact position of availability of funds to HEC he visited Planning and Development Division who has confirmed to him that a substantial amount of funds are available with HEC. As such there is no shortage of funds. HEC has misused funds available with them. He severely castigated HEC for exhibiting their callousness towards the plight of students. HEC did not take any action in pursuance of recommendation made by Standing Committees of National Assembly and Senate as it has no regard for the Parliament.

12. Furthermore, he informed the Committee that the HEC had misused used the funds available for the students. To illustrate his viewpoint he informed the Committee that the most expensive ticket for air travel to Cuba amounted to Rs. 160,000/- whereas the HEC had expended Rs. 290,000/- per ticket. He termed it as a case of financial embezzlement and held Executive Director, HEC responsible for this. He suggested that the matter be probed.

13. Subsequently, the honorable Chairman requested Chairman, HEC to brief the Committee on the subject issue. Before commencing formal briefing the Chairman, HEC lauded the services rendered by honourable Chairman in the field of education. He informed the Committee that the honourable Chairman had been his role model since his student days and he still holds him in the same esteem. He highly appreciated the kind gesture of the Government of Cuba to the Government of Pakistan during the devastating earthquake of October, 2005. The Government of Cuba deeply moved by the devastation brought around by the earthquake had offered 1000 Cuban scholarship Programme to Pakistani

students for medical studies in Cuba. He conceded that the programme had run into a few snags. Nevertheless, the HEC is making best efforts to resolve the problems being faced by the students in Cuba as well as their families in Pakistan. The briefing given by the officer is broadly classified under following heads:-

- i. Comparison of health indicators between Cuba and Pakistan
 - ii. Medical education in Cuba
 - iii. Details of the scholarships offered to the Government of Pakistan for 1000 students for medical studies in Cuba
14. The Chairman, HEC during briefing informed the Committee that PC-I of the project was approved by ECNEC on 30th November, 2006 at a total cost of Rs. 792.567 million. The scholarship offered included free transportation to Cuba, one return air ticket during studies and a monthly stipend of Euro 50/-. A National Steering Committee was constituted to steer and oversee the implementation details.
15. Furthermore, he informed that the selection of students was made on merit as per laid down criteria and as per PMDC rules. Referring to his recent meeting with H.E. Cuban Ambassador he informed that the Cuban Ambassador has informed that the medical colleges where Pakistani students are studying are included in the WHO directory. **A medical degree from ELAM will be issued to the Pakistani students after completion of their studies and Government of Cuba is willing to facilitate the students to ensure the success of the programme.**
16. As per terms and conditions of scholarship the Pakistani students were entitled for one air ticket during the entire study period. However, on the insistence of the parents a revised PC-I has been prepared by HEC requesting for increase in funds for the purpose. The approval of ECNEC is awaited. Referring to the apprehensions expressed by the Ex-Senator Raza Muhammad

Raza regarding lack of facilities for acquiring a medical degree in the existing school wherein the students are being imparted medical education, he informed that in the first two years of education the students are imparted purely theoretical education and in the third year the education is half non-clinical and half clinical. The remaining period is exclusively devoted to the clinical education. **He reiterated that a medical degree from ELAM recognized by WHO would be awarded to the Pakistani students after completion of their studies.**

17. The briefing given by the Chairman, HEC was followed by comments/views of President, PMDC. He informed the Committee that the NOC given by the PMDC to HEC which is often referred to was not an unusual NOC. The NOC was based on its standard format reproduced as under:-

- i. 60% minimum marks in FSc (Pre-Medical)
- ii. Degree from WHO recognized institution
- iii. Must pass PMDC examination in Pakistan on completion

18. Elaborating his comments he informed that he was elected as President of PMDC in 2007. In October, 2007 the problems being confronted by the Pakistani students in Cuba enunciated above were reported to him. As such it was decided by the PMDC to send a delegation with the objective to have report on the living conditions of the Pakistani students and on methods/materials available for the medical education to these students before grant of accreditation as requested by the HEC. **As per report of the delegation the HEC did not brief the students before their departure for Cuba and were also not willing to share information with the PMDC. The facilities provided to the students in Cuba were found to be grossly inadequate by the delegates and were even deficient enough to train the paramedics and not the medical doctors of the day. Apprehensions were expressed that the students would not be able to pass National Examination Board (NEB) test of PMDC. The President, PMDC proposed that a delegation comprising of**

two experts from HEC and two from PMDC be deputed to visit Cuba to take up the issues with the Cuban Government for their expeditious resolution.

19. The honourable Chairman after listening to the views/comments of all concerned concluded that PMDC and HEC did not do any comprehensive exercise prior to sending the students to Cuba. As a consequence of which the Pakistani students and their families have been put to an agonizing situation which is regrettable. There appeared to be a wide gulf between the perceptions of the Government of Cuba and the students who went to Cuba with a different objective. The students were not briefed regarding the level of medical education that would be imparted to them in Cuba. The honourable Chairman expressed his deep concern over the entire issue. **He informed the Committee that the Government of a country is like a mother. The Government should therefore play the role of a mother to protect these innocent students who are suffering because of no fault of their own. He informed the Committee that he himself would meet H.E. Ambassador of Cuba and solicit commitment from him that degree awarded to the students would have recognition of WHO. The report of his meeting with the H.E. Cuban Ambassador would be presented to the Committee in its next meeting which is due to be held on 15th February, 2010 in Islamabad.**

20. Referring to the purchase of air tickets for students at an exorbitant price of Rs. 290,000/- by HEC as pointed out by Ex-Senator Raza Ahmed Raza he requested Project Director, HEC to clarify the issue to the Committee. The Project Director informed the Committee that as per procedure laid down in PPRA Rules all codal formalities were completed by HEC prior to the purchase of tickets. Tenders were floated in the press and the contract was awarded to the lowest bidder who had then quoted the price of a ticket as Rs. 290,000/-. The Chairman, HEC endorsed the statement of the Project Director and informed the Committee that air tickets of Cuba are expensive as the flights back from Cuba are not fully booked and thus the airlines have to suffer financial loss. **The**

honourable Chairman directed Project Director, HEC to submit a written statement to the Secretary Committee regarding purchase of air tickets to Cuba.

Item No. ii

21. Senator Begum Najma Hameed drew attention of the honourable Chairman to an incident on 4th February, 2010 at NUML wherein a Brig. ® Obaidullah Ranjha, Registrar, NUML had thrashed Prof. Tahir Malik black and blue. She informed the committee that the accused Brig. has been appointed in NUML without following the laid down procedure. **She requested the honourable Chairman to take up the matter in the Committee and call the Vice Chancellor of the University in the meeting of the Standing Committee to explain the incident and also the details of procedures for making various appointments in the university. All the participants condemned the incident vehemently. The honourable Chairman agreed to take up the issue in the meeting of the Committee.**

22. Similarly, Senator Nilofar Bakhtiar also suggested to the honourable chairman that the Committee should investigate the deaths of students caused by the brutality of the teachers. She informed the Committee that quite a few death incidents have been recently reported in the press and needs to be investigated to address the situation. **The Chairman agreed to the request of the honourable Senator.**

23. The issue regarding appointment of full time Vice Chancellor of Hazara University was also taken up in the meeting as reported to the honourable Chairman by the Minister for Science and Technology. **The Executive Director, HEC informed the Committee that the issue has been solved and Dr. Sakhawat Shah has been appointed as full time Vice Chancellor of the Hazara University, NWFP. The honourable Chairman**

directed the Secretary Committee to inform the Minister for Science and Technology accordingly.

24. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd.-

**(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee**

Sd/-

**(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education**

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 9TH MARCH, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 9th March, 2010 at 4:00 p.m. in the Committee Room No. 4, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - iii. To consider the National Library Foundation Act and recommendations given by the Government.
 - ii. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-
 1. Senator Haifz Rashid Ahmed
 2. Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada
 3. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan
 4. Senator Begum Najma Hameed
 5. Sardar Aseff Ahmed Ali,
Advisor to the Prime Minister on Education
(Ex-officio member)
4. A list of officers of Ministry of Education and other invitees who attended the meeting is annexed.
5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman welcomed all the participants to the meeting. He drew attention of the participants to the meeting of the Committee held on 16th December, 2009 wherein recommendations were made by the Committee to promote library culture in Pakistan and informed the participants that the agenda of the instant meeting is directly co-related with those recommendations. He held the view that public library service is virtually non-existent in Pakistan. The significance of the subject issue can be gauged on

the basis of the fact that no country in the world can progress and prosper without availability of library culture. In recognition of this fact the Education Policy - 2009 has also excessively emphasized on the promotion of library culture in the country.

6. The honourable Chairman apprised the participants that he has examined Library Act in vogue in a few countries and as such he can safely infer that only those countries in the world have progressed and prospered who have adopted an extensive Library Act in their countries. To illustrate his viewpoint he informed the Committee that even colonial powers took due cognizance of the issue and had passed the first Library Act in the year 1936. Subsequently, after creation of Pakistan a six year National Plan (1951-57) was formulated for promotion of economic and social development of the country. The plan also envisaged promotion of libraries in the country. As per provision of the plan 486 libraries were to be established in the then East Pakistan and 38 libraries in the West Pakistan. The number of libraries proposed to be established in the West Pakistan truly reflected the feudal mindset of the people then at the helm of the affairs whose sole objective for establishing minimum libraries in the country was to keep the masses backward and away from education.

7. The honourable Chairman held the view that the subject issue has been neglected since long. There is now a dire need to have a comprehensive Library Act in the field so as to develop a culture wherein the libraries can grow and flourish. In this context the Parliament would play its due role in giving assent to the proposed Library Act. On the basis of this undertaking the Government should feel sufficiently strengthened and confident to bring in the best possible Library Act in the country.

8. This was followed by detailed comments/views by Advisor to the Prime Minister on Education. He expressed his gratitude to the honourable Chairman of the Committee for inviting him to attend the meeting of the Committee. He informed the Committee that he was basically groomed for Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Planning Commission and as such he had felt at

ease while heading these two Ministries/Departments. He has been recently appointed as Advisor to the Prime Minister on Education and being new to the assignment he is now-a-days trying to acclimatize himself with education sector. He expressed his disgust and dismay that it is almost over 60 years since Pakistan has been created. Even after lapse of this long span of time the nation has been kept illiterate as during all this time no tangible and significant efforts have been made by those heading this important sector for the growth of education and library culture in the country. As a sequel of which the literacy rate in the country has always remained very low. Till to-date the development plans so far formulated in the country had articulated and emphasized on the low rate of population growth on the presumption that the low rate of population growth always positively impacts the economic development of a country. The Economic Planners of a country did not focus themselves on the abundant human resources available in the country and did not at any stage make any positive effort to exploit this human potential. On the contrary they took this potential source of strength as a mere liability. To illustrate his standpoint he quoted economic development in Japan. The country had optimally exploited its human resource potential and is presently competitive with advanced countries of the world.

9. The honourable Advisor on Education held the view that as a result of this negligence of our economic and social planners the quality of education has also declined considerably and the unfortunate aspect of this whole scenario is that no body in the country wants to come forward to improve the situation. The situation is also further compounded by the fact that the subject of education has been devolved. The basic function of the Ministry of Education is to formulate policy. The major portion of the policy is implemented by the Provincial Departments of Education. Similarly, the Ministry has no authority to interfere in the functions and performance of Higher Education Commission (HEC) but at the same time it is answerable to Parliament for all the work being done or executed by the HEC. **As such this lacuna needs to be resolved for smooth functioning of education sector in the country.**

10. Furthermore, he informed the Committee that discontentment in the education sector is also caused by running of two parallel education system in the country i.e. public and private educational institutions. Private educational institutions are mostly English medium and the students qualifying from these institutions has an edge over those coming out from public sector institutions as the medium of instructions in these institutions is Urdu. Since all the competitive examinations are held in English language the students qualifying from Urdu medium schools are placed at disadvantageous position in these examinations. **All these issues needs to be redressed without any further loss of time.**

11. The honourable Advisor informed the Committee that he fully supports the promulgation of National Library Act, 2010. He held the view that libraries should be established at District and Tehsil levels and the proposed National Library Act should also incorporate this in the Act. He further proposed as under:-

- i. **Requisite funds for the Libraries should be identified.**
- ii. **Provision for support of private libraries should be incorporated in the Act.**
- iii. **There should be compulsory insurance of rare manuscripts/documents.**
- iv. **A Library should be set for national languages. Presently, 105 languages are being spoken in Pakistan. These languages will be wiped out if no library is set up in the country for their promotion.**

12. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman requested Secretary Education to explain the proposed draft National Library Act, 2010. In response the Secretary Education informed that during the preparation of the draft Act he had all along advised his officers and staff to seek advice/consultation with the honourable Chairman, being an authority on the subject issue. However, the draft Act has been finalized in the light of comments/views received by the

Ministry of Education from Provincial Education Departments. The Ministry has incorporated in the proposed Act following four basic issues:-

- i. The National Library would be a repository of all the books and magazines published in the country.
 - ii. The Act envisages constitution of an Advisory Board consisting of following members:-
 - a. Federal Education Secretary as Chairman
 - b. The Director General;
 - c. A representative of the Ministry for the time being dealing with the matters of the Library; and
 - d. Not less than four and not more than seven other members who shall be appointed by the Ministry of Education from renowned bibliophiles, authors and library science experts.
 - iii. In the light of this Act all the publishers would be mandated to submit copies of publications of their magazines/books to the National Library, Islamabad.
 - iv. The Library would provide bibliographical services, including national bibliographical services.
13. The Secretary Education also informed that National Library Foundation Act as envisaged in the National Policy - 2009 is also under consideration of the Ministry.
14. All the members of the committee endorsed the necessity of promulgation of National Library Act, 2010. Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada however, held the view that the Committee may further convene a joint meeting with the Standing Committee of National Assembly on Education to further strengthen the cause for promulgation of the Act. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan requested for putting in place an attractive career pattern for the qualified Librarians to make the profession attractive for talented youths of the country. In this context the Secretary Education informed the Committee that presently the Librarians are being appointed in BPS-15 and usually retire in BPS-17. In order to make the career attractive for the youths of the country they have submitted recommendations to Pay and Pension Committee. The recommendations if approved by the commission would provide induction of

Librarians in government service in BPS-17 and opportunities for rising in the career upto BPS-22. **The Secretary Education also requested the honourable Chairman for revival of Pakistan National Centers. The request was unanimously endorsed by the Committee.**

15. **After intensive discussion the committee unanimously recommended to Ministry of Education to initiate bill of the National Library Act, 2010 on priority basis. The honourable Chairman advised the Secretary Education to incorporate in the bill the fund clause and also co-relate it with the Library Act of Malaysia and India.**

Any other item

16. **To a query of the honourable Chairman regarding the existing status of the National Library, Islamabad. The Director General, National Library informed the Committee that the library is a repository of newspapers, magazines published in the country from the year 1950 onwards. Presently, the Library is maintaining 50,000 volumes of these rare magazines and newspapers. In addition to this there are 300,000 books in the Library on various subjects. 60% books and 80% magazines are in Urdu. The officer further informed that all books and magazines published in Pakistan are readily available in the Library. The honourable Chairman informed the Committee that there is a dire need to revamp the Library and advised Secretary Ministry of Education to look into its inadequacies to make it a model Library.**

17. **The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.**

Sd/-
(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-
(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - **MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 12TH JULY, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD**

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 12th July, 2010 at 11:00 a.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - iv. Briefing on the need and importance of comprehensive legislation in line with Article 25 (a) of the Constitution of Pakistan wherein free and compulsory education has been recognized as a constitutional right of the children of the age of 5 to 16 years.
 - v. Any other item with the permission of chair.

3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-
 1. Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal
 2. Senator Suriya Amiruddin
 3. Senator Maulana Gul Naseeb
 4. Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada
 5. Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil
 6. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan
 7. Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali
 8. Senator Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch
 9. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar
 10. Senator Begum Najma Hameed

4. A list of officers of Ministry of Education and other invitees who attended the meeting is annexed.

5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil, followed by introduction of members of the Committee. The honourable Chairman of the Committee initiating formal proceedings of the meeting offered his heartiest congratulations to all the members of the Committee and other participants in the meeting on the introduction of Article 25 (a) of the Constitution wherein free and compulsory education has been recognized as constitutional right of the children of the age of 5 to 16 years. The honourable Chairman held the view that if the aforesaid recommendation is honestly and sincerely implemented it will have a very positive affect on the existing educational standards of the country and would considerably contribute to its socio economic progress. Dilating on the absence of Minister and Secretary Education from the meeting, the honourable Chairman informed the Committee that both the Minister and Secretary Education had requested him for postponement of the meeting because of their official commitments abroad. However, keeping in view the significance of the agenda of the meeting he could not accede to their request. Despite this the honourable Chairman conveyed his hard feelings to the members of the Committee and other participants on the vacuum created by non-attendance of both the officers in the meeting. He noted with pleasure the presence of representatives of Education Departments of Government of Sindh, Balochistan and Khyber-Pakthunkhwa and simultaneously regretted the non-presence of representative of Education Department of Govt. of Punjab in the meeting. He held the view that Punjab being the biggest province of the country should have represented itself in the meeting which was of enormous significance and the agenda of which would have a direct bearing on the current educational scenario of the country. He deeply regretted the non-participation of the Govt. of Punjab in the meeting.

6. Against above perspective he introduced Mr. Arsahd Saeed Khan of UNESCO, Islamabad. He informed the Committee that keeping in view the command of the officer on the issues relating to right to education in Pakistan he

has invited him to apprise the Committee with his statistical analysis and his research work on the subject issue. He expressed his gratitude to the officer for having accepted his invitation and for having shown his presence in the meeting. Referring to Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010 he informed the participants that till recently education was not a fundamental right. Article 25 (a) which recognizes education as constitutional right of the children has been introduced in the constitution with the complete consensus of the Parliamentary Committee. The Article reads as under:-

“25 (a) The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law”

7. **In Article 7 of the Constitution the State has been defined as the Federal Government, [Majlis-e-Shoora, Parliament] a Provincial Government, a Provincial Assembly and such local and other authorities in Pakistan as are by law empowered to impose any tax or cess.**

8. Furthermore, the honourable Chairman tracing back the history of Islamic Civilization informed the Committee that the entire edifice of Islamic Civilization was based on solid foundation of education. As such the importance of education in the growth of civilization and prosperity of the country cannot be overlooked. The introduction of Article 25 (a) in the Constitution is based on the same logic and mindset. The Committee should proactively give practical shape to the thinking behind the legislation. This may prove to be a difficult path for the Committee as the budget allocation to the education sector in the current fiscal year has been substantially reduced and as **a consequent to this reduction only 2% of the allocated budget in the current fiscal year could be allocated for initiating new projects. Against this backdrop tough challenges are foreseen to bring improvements in the education sector.**

9. The honourable Chairman stressed the need for dilating on following essential issues for framing a comprehensive legislation in line with Article 25(a) of the Constitution:-

- i. Definition of state
- ii. Definition of compulsory education
- vi. Provision of curriculum
- vii. Issues relating to accessibility and free education to the children. Ratio between school and teacher needs to be determined so as to provide optimum education to the children between the ages of five to sixteen years as envisaged in the Article.
- viii. The type of building of schools wherein students are to be provided education.
- ix. Orientation of the children between the age group of three to five years so as to provide them basic foundation for future education.

10. The honourable Chairman while elaborating on the aforelisted issues informed the Committee that he has gone through constitution of various countries with the objective to put in place a comprehensive legislation in line with Article 25 (a) of the Constitution. **Keeping in view Federal Legislative Lists of the Constitution the Federal Government has the right to provide guidance to the provinces for framing a comprehensive legislation in respect of the Article 25 (a) of the Constitution. He requested Mr. Arshad Saeed Khan to give a briefing to the participants on the issues relating to right to education in Pakistan.**

11. The officer gave a detailed briefing. The contents of the briefing given by the officer are listed as under:-

- i. Right to Education and Education for all (EFA)
- ii. Financing of education in Pakistan
- iii. Right to education (Article 25 (a))

12. The inferences drawn by the officer based on statistical analysis conducted by him portrayed a very dismal picture of current education scenario in Pakistan. He informed the participants that as per EFA global monitoring report 2010 the HDI Ranking of Pakistan is 141. Public expenditure on education in Pakistan is 2.8% of its GNP and literacy rate in Pakistan is 54%. In view of the declining public expenditure on education and continuous neglect of this important sector Pakistan is continuously lagging behind and will need 38 years (by 2047) to achieve UPE (100% NER) and 16 years (2025) to achieve 86% literacy rate. Hence Pakistan will not be able to achieve the goal regarding education for all (EFA) by 2015.

13. In addition to above Pakistan has not yet ratified UNESCO convention against discrimination in education, 1960 which inter alia envisages free and compulsory education, equivalent standards of education in all public institutions and equivalent conditions. The new education policy of 2009 also lacks any reference to ratification of this convention.

14. The officer proposed following strategic actions:-

- i. Immediate legislation for implementation of Article 25 (a) of the Constitution.
- ii. 7% of GDP should be allocated for education.
- iii. Elementary education should be made completely free.
- iv. Mid-day meals should be provided in all schools.
- v. Enforcement of compulsory primary education Acts by the provinces.
- vi. Parliamentarians to lead EFA campaigns in their constituencies.
- vii. Ratification of UNESCO convention against discrimination in education (1960).

15. The Joint Education Advisor, Ministry of Education who is also a Focal Person of the project informed the Committee that as per Pakistan's education statistics 2008-2009 the total population of students between the age group of five to sixteen from Primary to Higher Secondary level was 44 million and the gross enrolment was 25.5 million. **As such 19 million students are needed to be enrolled in educational institutions at various levels. He informed that the existing infrastructure for primary level education in Pakistan is sufficient whereas there is a shortage of schools for middle level and secondary level education.**

16. The honourable Chairman referring to Article 7 (ii) of the Indian Constitution relating to the Right of Children to free and compulsory education defining compulsory education and various other ordinances on the subject issue informed the Committee that the provisions contained in these Acts/Ordinances are highly inadequate and as such needs to be rehashed. Pakistan is committed to achieve the objective of Education For All (EFA by 2015) as such it is the responsibility of the Standing Committee on Education to examine the issues threadbare and evolve a strategy to achieve the goal. He therefore, elicited views of members of the Committee on the issues. The proposals/views given by the honourable members of the Committee are detailed as under:-

- i. In view of declining education standard in the public sector institutions the parents are constrained to send their children to private educational institutions despite their limited resources. The private schools in Islamabad are being regulated by Private School Regulatory Authority who arbitrarily enhance the fees etc. and literally have complete monopoly. The Ministry of Education should therefore play their due role to mitigate the financial woes of the parents and also for the betterment of education being imparted in these schools. In addition to this the Ministry of Education and the administrative departments under their control are top heavy and as such are a financial burden on the national exchequer. The staff strength needs to be rationalized so as to make available resources to educational institutions. **(Senator Mrs. Dr. Saeeda Iqbal)**
- ii. (a) The issues relating to 15 Pakistani students who had gone to Cuba on scholarship for medical studies but have now been expelled by

the Cuban Government reportedly because of their involvement in activities in conflict with Cuban laws be decided on the analogy of students repatriated from Kyrgyzstan. **(Senator Mir Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali)**

- (b). The Cadet Colleges in province of Balochistan are on take off stage and as such these colleges needs to be strengthened and provided funds. The Committee should also evolve a solid strategy for providing comprehensive assistance to the provinces in the field of education in the light of Eighteen amendment **(Senator Mir Muhammad Jan Jamali)**
- iii. Standard of education in the province of Balochistan are on continuous decline. The competent teachers of the University of Balochistan have left the province owing to deteriorating law and order situation in the province. This needs to be looked into. Moreover, because of rampant poverty in the province the importance of education among the downtrodden people of the province has diminished considerably. In order to arrest continuous decline in education level in the province the Government should adopt measures on war footing to eliminate poverty in the province and enhance accessibility of education in the backward regions and far flung areas of the province. **(Senator Suriya Amiruddin)**
- iv. Expressed his gratitude to the honourable Chairman for taking up agenda of high significance. The Committee was informed of the declining standard of education in the provinces. On the basis of his education received from a Madrassah he held the view that the time is ripe for a deep review of the existing educational standards of the country. A human being is made up of soul and body. As such both soul and body of a human being needs to be strengthened by imparting education based on both religion and Science and Technology. The importance of teachers needs to be emphasized. **A reference in this context was made on the saying of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) who had repeatedly said that he has been sent in this world as a teacher. The national languages also needs to be given due importance for imparting education to the children. (Senator Molana Gul Naseeb)**
- v. All ghost schools in the country should identified and made functional and there should be no discrimination between the religious and the scientific and technical education. The discrimination between two types of education is a conspiracy against the education system of the country. **(Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada)**
- vi. The Government has not apprised the people with the reasons regarding current reduction in the budget allocated for education. This is all the more intriguing as the Government repeatedly

advocates due importance to the education but concurrently has reduced funds for the education. The private schools functioning in the province of Khyber-Pakthunkhwa are literally in a very bad shape. The fees charged by them are exorbitant and the teachers appointed in these institutions are not qualified to teach students. Resultantly, the level of education being imparted to the students is not upto the mark. In addition to this there is a growing tendency in the Khyber-Pakthunkhwa province for not permitting females to acquire education considering it to be below morality. This thinking needs to be curbed and the Federal Ministry of Education and Provincial Education Department, Govt. of Khyber-Pakthunkhwa should take due cognizance of these issues to promote growth of education in the province. She also emphasized for inclusion of poetry of Allama Iqbal and other national heroes in the syllabus of the schools so as to give the children a role model for building up their character. **(Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil)**

- vii. Enactment of Federal law is very important for regulating education and providing guidelines to the Provincial Education Department. **(Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan)**
- viii. Primary education budget has been reduced in the current budget. It needs to be enhanced. The ghost schools should be identified and reactivated. There is a dire need to improve standard of teachers and improvement of facilities in the schools located in far flung regions of the country. The reports regarding functioning of schools should be made after physical inspection and on the basis of ground realities. **(Senator Begum Najma Hameed)**
- ix. Ways and means should be explored to effectively implement Article 25 (a) in the provinces. In the province of Balochistan there is no shortage of school buildings and the students. There is a shortage of teachers who have left the province because of target killings and the deteriorating law and order situation in the province. Moreover, poverty in the province is the main impediment in the way of education and as such this aspect needs to be looked into thoroughly. The Ministry of Education should also investigate and monitor the flow of funds from the NGOs to various educational institutions as the utilization of the funds is not visible any where in the province. In order to meet shortfall of the funds the Bait-ul-Mal should also be approached for additional finances. **(Senator Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch)**

17. The Provincial Minister for Education of Khyber-Pakthunkhwa painted an encouraging picture of education in his province. He informed the Committee that during military operations in the various regions of the province

and the current law and order situation the educational institutions suffered the most. The students were constrained to carry on their education under the open sky because of non-availability of school buildings. The situation has now improved a lot. The President of Pakistan has made a commitment for provision of 1000 schools in the province. Administrative approval of these schools is, however, still awaited. There were 11000 ghost schools in the province. Of these ghost institutions more than 700 institutions have been reactivated and Committees have been established to monitor these institutions. Referring to the apprehension of honourable Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil regarding resistance in the province for sending females to schools, he informed the Committee that 70% of the ADP of budget allocated for education has been exclusively reserved for female education. The honourable Minister for Education expressed his concern regarding high construction cost which amounts to Rs. 13 lakhs, normally expended by the provincial Government on the construction of a single room of school. To monitor this expenditure a full-fledged set up has been established by him to optimally utilize funds allocated for education in the province and for enhancing literacy rate. In addition to this Board of Governors have been established at Secondary and Higher Secondary levels to utilize the services of experience and competent teachers and recruitment of the teachers is made purely on merit.

18. In order to promote education among the children the Government of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa has started a scheme wherein a stipend of Rs. 200/- per month is being given to children from class 1 to 10. This scheme has produced very positive impact on the growth of education in the province as the enrolment of students in schools has increased considerably. To promote discipline in the educational institutions the administrative powers which were earlier centralized have been devolved and the teachers have been empowered to check absenteeism in schools, teachers in management cadres have been separated to prevent politicization of educational institutions and promote good governance.

As a result of these measures the Government of Khyber-Pakthunkhwa has become a role model in the education sector.

19. The Addl. Secretary, Ministry of Education proposed that curriculum of all the schools in the provinces should be uniform and in order to provide compulsory education for children between the ages of 5 to 16 years as envisaged in Article 25 (a) of the constitution all exemptions seeking denial of education should be abolished. The Addl. Secretary, Department of Education, Govt. of Sindh proposed that uniformity in the curriculum as proposed by the Addl. Secretary, Ministry of Education can best be achieved through better coordination between the provinces and Federal Government.

20. The honourable Chairman responding to the discussion regarding uniformity of curriculum in all the provinces suggested that Article 144 and 147 of the Constitution regarding **“Power of Parliament to legislate for one or more provinces by consent”** and **“Power of the provinces to entrust functions to the federation”** respectively should be revisited. Responding to a query of representative of Education Department, Govt. of Balochistan he informed that Article 267 (a) of the Constitution should be invoked only in case of any difficulty.

21. The Committee after intensive discussion made the following recommendations:-

- i. Federal law should be enacted to implement Article 25 (a) of the Constitution.
- ii. All provincial Governments should have a uniform curriculum.
- iii. In order to augment the shortage of funds for the education sector, funds available in Bait-ul-Mal should be utilized.
- iv. The future of fifteen Pakistani students who had gone to Cuba for medical studies on a Cuban Scholarship scheme but were later repatriated to Pakistan should be secured by exploring the possibility of their accommodation in Pakistani medical colleges.
- v. The Government of Pakistan should initiate measures to prevent target killing in the province of Balochistan.

22. To implement recommendation No. (i) above, a sub-committee consisting of the following was constituted to draft a Model Federal Law to implement Article 25 (a) of the Constitution:-

- | | | |
|------|--|----------|
| i. | Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal | Convener |
| ii. | Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan | Member |
| iii. | Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil | Member |
| iv. | Dr. M. Saleem
Joint Education Advisor | Member |
| v. | Mr. Arshad Saeed Khan
UNESCO | Member |

The Ministry of Education would request Provincial Governments for nomination of a member on the Sub-Committee.

23. The Secretary of the Committee Mr. Abdul Sami khan shall act as Secretary of the Sub-Committee.

24. The Sub-Committee in drafting the federal law to implement Article 25 (a) of the Constitution shall keep in view the following:-

- Need to comprehensively define compulsory education.
- To provide some provision for preparing children below the age of five years.
- Possible incorporation of provision of Child Protection Act.
- In order to augment shortage of funds for education sector possible use of funds in Bait-ul-Mal shall also be examined.

25. The report of the Sub-Committee alongwith the draft federal law shall be presented before the Committee within three months.

26. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 12TH NOVEMBER, 2009 AT ISLAMABAD

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 12th November, 2009 at 11.00 a.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
- i. Briefing on existing security arrangements at the educational institutions in the country.
 - ii. Discussion to formulate vision and program of the Standing Committee on Education for the year 2009-10.
 - iii. Any other item with the permission of chair.

3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-

1. Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin	Member
2. Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil	Member
3. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan	Member
4. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar	Member
5. Senator Begum Najma Hameed	Member
6. Mir Hazar Khan Bijarani Minister for Education	Ex-officio member

4. A list of officers of Ministry of Education, Federal Directorate of Education (FDE), Islamabad, Private Educational Institutions Regulatory Authority (PEIRA) and Ministry of Interior who attended the meeting is annexed.

5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman welcomed all the participants to the meeting. He informed the participants that after the election of Chairmen Standing Committees, this is the first meeting of the Committee. The first meeting of the Committee should have focused on

promotion of Education in the country and bringing improvements in curricula of various universities/colleges/schools. Unfortunately, the existing security environment in the country has changed priorities. Security of the institutions has assumed high significance. The educational institutions in the country are under constant threat of the militants. This is the first time in history of Pakistan that security and education have become interrelated. Referring to the quote “well being after being first” he impressed upon the point that in the existing security scenario the security of an educational institution has acquired primacy over education.

6. Against above background the honourable Chairman expressed his confidence that the Government is fully alive to the issue and must have adopted stringent measures to put in place an invincible security network in and around educational institutions. The Parliament is also in constant touch with the masses on the subject issue. Nevertheless, the Committee would appreciate if it is apprised of in detail whether the measures taken by the Government for the security of educational institutions have been effective. In case there are any shortcomings in these measures then the reasons thereof and suggested remedial options be indicated.

ITEM NO. i

7. The Secretary, Ministry of Education in his opening remarks congratulated Chairman on his election as Chairman Standing Committee on Education. He informed that security of educational institutions is a very serious issue having multiple ramifications. Recounting unpleasant effects of militancy on education he informed the Committee that in the wake of current wave of militancy the educational institutions in Sindh were closed initially. This was followed by closure of the educational institutions in NWFP and Punjab. He clarified that majority of educational institutions in the Provinces are governed by their respective Departments of Education.

8. Furthermore, he informed that against the background of sporadic incidents of militancy in the country he discussed the issue regarding closure of educational institutions in Islamabad with Director General, FDE who advised him against closure of educational institutions in Islamabad as it would create an unnecessary panic. However, after a suicide attack on International Islamic University (IIU), Islamabad, he decided to close down all the educational institutions in Islamabad. The Government owned educational institutes remained closed for the period from 21-25 October, 2009. Private educational institutes were closed down by their respective managements.

9. Elaborating, the measures taken by the Ministry in the wake of suicide attack on IIU he informed the committee that a high level meeting was held on October 21, 2009, jointly presided over by Education Minister and Minister for Interior and was attended by Education Secretary, Secretary, Ministry of Interior, Vice Chancellors, Director General (Education) and Heads of Educational Institutions. The following four Committees were constituted to chalk-out Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for foolproof security arrangements in and around 418 educational institutes in ICT and various universities under Federal Government:-

- i. Core Committee with Secretary Interior as Chairman
- ii. Committee for Universities comprising of Vice Chancellors
- iii. Committee for Colleges in ICT comprising of Senior Principals of F.G. Colleges and Islamabad Model Colleges alongwith Director (Colleges) & Director (Model Colleges)
- iv. Committee for Schools in ICT comprising of Senior Principals of F.G. Schools alongwith with Director Schools (Male), Director Schools (Female) and Area Education Officers (AEOs)

10. The Chairman, Private Educational Institutions Regulatory Authority (PEIRA) apprised the Committee with the existing security arrangements pertaining to the Private Educational Institutions (PEI) of ICT registered with the Authority. He gave details of instructions issued by him to 665 PEI's in ICT

before and after the current wave of militancy. **He informed the Committee that as per findings of a survey conducted by him the security measures are relatively satisfactory for only those PEIs having chain of schools. The Security measures of single branch PEIs are less satisfactory and in certain cases unsatisfactory.**

11. The Minister for Education also recounted the measures adopted by his Ministry to ensure safety and security of educational institutions. He informed the Committee that vigilance Committees have been constituted in the educational institutions to oversee and monitor security arrangements. But despite all this there is still panic among the students and parents, affecting overall attendance in the institutions.

12. To a query made by the honourable Chairman the Secretary, Education informed the Committee that Ministry of Education to-date has been able to comprehensively put in security arrangements in 50% of schools located in cities. The Ministry has prepared a comprehensive scheme for educational institutions in rural areas and has forwarded the same to Planning and Development Division for approval. **The Secretary conveyed to Committee his apprehensions regarding security of school buses which according to him are not risk free. However, to ward off any untoward incident the Conductor/Driver of the school bus has been instructed to close one gate of the school bus permanently and only those conductors/drivers are deputed on school buses who are familiar with the students. The students are allowed entry into the buses after comprehensively verifying their identity.**

13. The Joint Secretary, Ministry of Interior informed the Committee that in the wake of suicide bomb attack on IIU, Islamabad the security in educational institutions in all the four provinces have been beefed up. There is a visible improvement in the security situation in and around educational

institutions in the country. **However, there is a dire need to provide security gadgets to educational institutions, which have not yet been provided to all institutions because of resource constraints. The Police strength has been enhanced in and around educational institutions, Control Rooms have been established and District Administration all over the country is co-ordinating with educational institutions on the subject issue.**

14. The Committee scrutinized SOP's established by the Ministry for foolproof security measures of FGEl's and recommended that following measures should also included in the SOP's:-

- i. **Only parents or kith and kin of students duly authorized by them should be allowed to visit them.**
- ii. **No vehicle should be allowed to park near educational institutions.**
- iii. **Dedicated sharp shooters should be posted on the roof-tops of educational institutions to pre-empt any suicide attack.**
- iv. **Vendors should not be allowed to hang around educational institutions.**
- v. **Guards posted on the entrance gates of educational institutions should be armed, well trained and wear uniform.**

15. In addition to above the honourable members of the Committee gave following proposals to strengthen security arrangements in and around educational institutions which were unanimously endorsed by the Committee:-

- i. **Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan held the view that the primary responsibility of Ministry of Interior is to oversee and maintain overall security environment of the country and to establish the writ of the Government. The public is not informed about the fate of the accused nabbed by the Police in connection with militancy. He proposed that exemplary punishment should be given to those culprits who are caught in the incidents of suicide attacks or in any case involving breach of law. This is all the more essential to deter others. He brought to the notice of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Interior recent case of**

kidnapping of Vice Chancellor of University of Kohat and suggested to make serious efforts to secure his release.

ii. Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin suggested that male visitors should be strictly forbidden in institutions exclusively for girls.

iii. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar proposed as under:-

a. Ministry of Education should take measures on priority basis to put a leash on the administrators of Private Educational Institutions. The heads of these institutions charge heavy fees from the parents and behave insolently and indifferently with them. This tendency needs to be curbed.

b. The government should provide import free security gadgets to educational institutions and there should be some centralized mechanism for supply these gadgets to them.

c. The government has not made any security arrangements in educational institutions re-opened in Swat, FATA and Malakand Divisions. As such there is a dire need to look into the issue to ward off any untoward incident.

d. The students and teachers of educational institutions in Swat, blown up by the militants, have sacrificed their lives. Monuments should be build by the government to commemorate their sacrifices.

e. The next meeting of the Committee should include in its agenda briefing on educational institutions in Swat.

f. The guards posted on the gates of educational institutions should be provided with uniforms to facilitate their identification.

g. There are quite a few schools in Islamabad who have not taken any security measures. These schools should be closed down to pre-empt any untoward incident.

iv. Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil expressed her apprehension regarding online teaching resorted to by Beaconhouse School in NWFP. She expressed her apprehension on efficacy of the system. She also proposed for a comprehensive probe into the proposed online teaching system and excessive increase

in fees by these institutions on account of security arrangements.

16. The honourable Chairman also requested Joint Secretary, Ministry of Interior to apprise the Committee with counter-terrorism measures learned by the Ministry from the experience of other countries. Responding to it the Joint Secretary informed that Ministry of Interior is examining every façade of the current wave of terrorism especially its influx in educational institutions. **Among the contemplated measures include increased deployment of Police in uniform and in plainclothes around educational institutions and constant contact with agencies. He proposed that Ministry of Interior can give a detailed in-camera briefing on these measures. The honourable Chairman advised him to co-ordinate with Secretary Committee to arrange for an in-camera briefing for the Committee on the subject issue.**

17. The honourable Chairman concluding discussion on item No. i of the agenda informed the Committee that in view of current domestic/international security scenario he foresees that the nation may have to live in existing security milieu for a long time. **However, he advised the Ministry that there should be no relaxation in SOPs for security arrangements at educational institutions. The next meeting of the Committee on security related issues will be held after two months and the issue will be examined in more detail. He expressed the hope that no untoward incident occurs in the country by that time.**

Item No. ii

18. The Committee approved its vision and programme for the year 2009-10 as under:-

- i. The honourable Chairman held the view that that since education is a very important issue the Committee should usually hold maximum

meetings. However, the committee decided to hold atleast one meeting in a month.

- ii. The Committee would focus on following issues:-
 - i. Illiteracy
 - ii. Non-Formal Education
 - iii. Technical Education
 - iv. Higher Education
- iii. A Committee comprising following four members was constituted to give a follow-up report on previous recommendations of Committee:-

a.	Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan	Convener
b.	Senator Begum Najma Hameed	Member
c.	Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil	Member
d.	Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin	Member
- iv. Report of the meetings of the Committee would be compiled on quarterly basis.
- v. Ministry of Education would provide Committee a list of educational institutions and the Committee would visit educational institutions located in various provinces.
- vi. A marathon session of the Committee would be held to discuss National Educational Policy 2009-10.
- vii. Senate Secretariat will develop a website of Standing Committee on Education and it will be linked with the website of Ministry of Education.
- viii. The Committee would convene a meeting to discuss exclusively issues relating to Private Educational institutions.
- ix. Issues relating Madressah Education will be taken up by the Committee.
- x. Budget issues of Ministry of Education and Higher Education Commission will be discussed threadbare by the Committee in its meetings. A meeting would be held in the first week of January to

exclusively discuss allocation/utilization of budget for the first quarter of the current fiscal year (2009-2010).

- xi. A pre-budget meeting on budget issues will be held in March, 2009.
 - xii. Issues relating to merits/demerits of Students Unions in educational institutions will be taken up by the Committee.
 - xiii. The Committee will take a detailed briefing from Ministry of Education on foreign funding.
 - xiv. A comprehensive briefing on educational institutions in Malakand, FATA and Waziristan will be held. The briefing will encompass issues relating to compensation to victims of blown up educational institutions and construction of monuments to commemorate sacrifices of students/teaches.
19. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 15TH FEBRUARY, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 15th February, 2010 at 11:00 p.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - i. Briefing on accessibility and standard of performance of Higher Education Commission and proposed measures, if any, for improvement.
 - ii. The Committee to identify neglected areas in the education sector and firm up recommendations to bring improvements in them.
 - iii. To discuss following starred question No. 49 moved by Senator Dr. Khalid Mahmood Soomro in the sitting of the Senate on 24th April, 2009 referred to the Standing Committee by the House:-

“Will the Minister for Education be pleased to state the names of organizations/institutions to which funds have been provided by H.E.C. during the last ten years indicating also the details of amount of funds provided in each case?”
 - iv. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-
 1. Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal
 2. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar
 11. Senator Begum Najma Hameed
4. Dr. Javiad R. Laghari, Chairman, HEC attended the meeting as a Special Invitee. A list of officers of Ministry of Education and Higher Education Commission (HEC) who attended the meeting is annexed.
5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Raza Muhammad Raza, Ex-Senator. Due to belated commencement of the meeting

and paucity of time the honourable Chairman decided to defer consideration of the agenda items listed above to the next meeting of the Committee and decided to take up the following issues:-

- i. Administrative and financial irregularities in the Hazara University.
- ii. Plight of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored by HEC to study medicine in Cuba.

**Administrative and financial irregularities
in the Hazara University**

6. Minister for Science and Technology raised a point of order in the sitting of the House held on 9th February, 2010 to draw attention of the Chairman Senate to the various administrative and financial irregularities committed in the Hazara University, NWFP and requested for their redressal. These are listed as under:-

Non-observance of Hazara University Statutes

- i. As per Rules 8.3 and 8.4, irregular appointments have been made in BPS-1-16 mostly from among relatives.
- ii. According to rule No. 8.6, 50% appointments in BPS-1 and BPS-2 be made from Hazara Division. This rule was changed without approval of the competent authority and irregular appointments were made.

iii. **Appointment of Registrar**

As per Statutes of Hazara University schedule-1(b) at S. No. 1, qualification of Registrar is Ph.D with 15 years experience and holding first class MA, MSc degree with 18 years experience whereas Mr. Sher Ali Khan selected for this post in 2nd Division in the relevant subject and his experience is for Technical post and not for administrative post. Moreover, Mr. Sher Ali Khan fraudulently presented two LPCs, one as retired and the other as serving government College Professor.

iv. **Appointment of Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmed in Grade-21**

Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmed having two 3rd Divisions in his career was appointed as Professor in BPS-21 in clear violation of HEC eligibility criteria and statutes.

- v. **Appointments of Assistant Treasurer (Finance)**
Mr. Khurram Jamal, a real nephew of Dr. Ihsan Ali, V.C. Hazara University, was appointed without required experience and qualification in relevant field.
- vi. **Appointments**
All non-teaching and administrative appointments were made through direct appointments ignoring promotion cases of senior staff in violation of appointment rules.
- vii. **Appointment of Mr. Shah-e-room as Deputy Registrar**
According to schedule 1(b) S. No. 12, six years relevant experience of administration is required for appointment of Deputy Registrar, whereas Mr. Shah-e-room having relevant experience of seven months was granted Grade-18 as Deputy Registrar.
- viii. **Non-observance of Hazara University Act, 1997**
Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmed, Prof. Dr. Mukarrab Shah and Prof. Dr. Muhammad Suleman were candidates for various posts and were also members of the selection board in clear violation of Hazara University Act, 1997 (Section 10(5)).

Financial Irregularities

- i. **Heavy expenditure on the renovation of V.C. House at Peshawar**
The V.C. House at Peshawar (property of Peshawar University) was renovated at exhorbited cost of Rs. 1,066,445/-) a clear violation of financial rules and regulations.
- ii. **Misuse of Government Money**
Five officers including the Vice Chancellor were given loan amounting to Rs. 37.5 million for purchase of land which was refunded after lapse of one year when the subject appeared in the press.
- iii. **Payment of Medical bills to nearest relatives of the V.C.**
(a) An amount of Rs. 327,314 was paid to Mr. Akhtar Zeb, Deputy Treasure without observance of medical rules according to which only Rs. 10,000/- once in a year can be reimbursed.
(b) Similarly, Rs. 950,000/- were paid to Mr. Ihsan, System Programmer (closed relative of V.C.) for treatment of his son against the rules.

iv. **Payment of heavy amount as advance for construction/repair/maintenance**

An amount of Rs. 20 million was paid in advance to Mr. Sohail Alamgir on different dates for construction/repairs of buildings of the University which is clear violations of rules 14.1.0 and 15.1.0. Besides, Rs. 50,000 to 300,000 were granted to all employees residing in the Campus of University accommodation at their own.

v. A heavy amount was also paid to M/s Faisal Construction Contractor without calling tenders etc.

vi. **Repatriation of two Audit Officers**

Mr. Qazi Abdul Salam, Audit Officer from A.G. Office and Mr. Muhammad Ali, RAD Audit were repatriated as they pointed out violation of Hazara University Act and rules.

vii. **Purchase of vehicles**

All vehicles have been purchased from Mardan Motors without observing codal formalities and rules.

viii. **Purchase of Books**

Books for approx. Rs. 100 million were purchased from Pak Asia Book, Lahore without observing codal formalities. The books were old Editions.

ix. **Concession in the Fees**

Fee concession to students who were close to of the V.C. were granted for example Mr. Imtiaz Ahmed S/o Hakim Khan and Ms. Nazia D/o Akbar Khan, Deputy Treasurer Hazara University.

7. Minister for Science and Technology while explaining the aforesaid financial and administrative irregularities to the Committee informed that the Governor who is a Chancellor of Hazara University had appointed one Vice Chancellor for the two universities in NWFP i.e. Mardan University and Hazara University. This led to massive administrative/financial irregularities in the University of Hazara. The objective of bringing to light these irregularities and for taking necessary remedial measures is to strengthen the university. The honourable Minister also informed the committee that he has personal attachment with the Hazara University as he has spent over Rs. 86 lacks on the university from his personal account. **The matter was examined at length and the honourable Chairman of the Committee decided that a Committee of Higher Education Commission should probe into the matter and send a report to the Committee within four weeks for further deliberations to chalk**

out measures to obviate the possibility of recurrence of any further irregularities at the Hazara university and also fix responsibilities for the alleged irregularities.

**Plight of 1000 Pakistani students sponsored
by HEC to study medicine in Cuba**

8. Pursuant to recommendation made in the requisitioned meeting of Senate Standing Committee on Education held on February 8, 2010 in the Parliament House, Islamabad, the Chairman, Senate Standing Committee on Education held a meeting with H.E. Cuban Ambassador and representatives of PM&DC and HEC at 3:00 pm in the office of Chairman, Higher Education Commission to find solutions to various problems being faced by 932 Pakistani students studying in medical schools in Cuba on Cuban scholarship.

9. The honourable Chairman apprised the members with the outcome of the meeting. The salient features of the meeting and the assurances given by the H.E. Cuban Ambassador on the subject issue as listed as under:-

- i. The curriculum of studies for the Pakistani students under the scholarship programme offered by the Cuban Government is the same as that of Latin American School of Medicines (ELAM). The Pakistani students after completion of their studies would be awarded a medical degree and not a certificate. The Embassy of Republic of Cuba had confirmed this vide their letter dated November 12, 2007 issued to HEC.
- ii. The degree awarded to the Pakistani students by the Government of Cuba would have recognition of WHO.
- iii. The students after obtaining degrees from Cuba will have to pass the NEB examination conducted by PMDC for practicing as a qualified doctor in Pakistan.
- iv. Due to lack of morbidity in Cuba the students are not taught on the actual dead bodies but on the basis of computer animations of various parts of the bodies. In the first two years of medical education the students are imparted purely theoretical education. Subsequent, to this they are rotated to different hospitals. The first batch of Pakistani students are due for rotation in the batches of 330 students each. They would be thus be relocated to the nearest hospitals.

- v. The Cuban Government did their best to address the concerns of Pakistani students in Cuba. They are importing Halal meat as demanded by Pakistani students and on this account they are expending substantial amount of foreign exchange. They had also made arrangements to enable the Pakistani students to watch GEO and PTV to keep them in touch with their home country.
10. Against above background the honourable Chairman also had a teleconference with Prof. Masood Hameed, Vice Chancellor, Dow medical College, Karachi on February 12, 2010. He informed the Chairman that students in Cuba will be trained according to the Cuban system of education as medical education curriculum varies from country to country. Coming to the solution for these students who take up the examination of National Examination Board, the Dow University of Health Sciences (DUHS) can prepare for them the web-based modules so that while they are studying in Cuba they can also go through these modules year by year. These web-based modules will also help foreign medical graduates coming from other countries to Pakistan to prepare NEB, PMDC. As the first batch of Pakistani students is in 3rd year, we can make a module for them for the 3rd year in 3 month's time and for the next 4th, 5th and 6th year over a period of 6 months. Modules would be replica of what Pakistani doctors prepare when they have to take USMLE examination on CD-based programme. The Committee unanimously endorsed the proposal.
11. The honourable Chairman requested the Ex- Senator Raza Muhammad Raza to apprise the Committee with his views in the light of above assurances given by H.E. Cuban Ambassador and the proposal of Prof. Masood Hameed, Vice Chancellor, Dow Medical College. The Senator held his previous stance regarding inferior quality of medical education being imparted to the Pakistani students in Cuba. He informed the committee that HEC and PMDC had all along been mis-quoting the facts and has thus created confusion and despondency among the students as well as their parents. Due to the inferior quality of education quite a few countries have withdrawn their students. He held his conviction that on the basis of quality of medical education being imparted to

the Pakistani students they would never be able to become qualified doctors except paramedics.

12. The Executive Director, HEC informed the Committee that he had a detailed discussion on the subject issue with the concerned officer of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. He was informed that the Government of Cuba is highly concerned with the issue. He proposed that a delegation be sent to Cuba immediately and a written agreement be executed with the Government of Cuba so that the subject issue is settled once and for all.

13. **After extensive discussion the Committee unanimously recommended that a three member delegation comprising one member each from Senate, PMDC and HEC should visit Cuba as early as possible and a written agreement should be finalized to close the issue permanently.**

14. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - **MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 16TH DECEMBER, 2009 AT ISLAMABAD**

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 16th December, 2009 at 11.00 a.m. in the Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - i. Briefing on:-
 - a. Existing state of Libraries under Ministry of Education and measures being taken by the Ministry to promote library culture in the country.
 - b. Necessity to legislate for maintaining/up-gradation of existing Libraries in the country.
 - ii. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-

1.	Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal	Member
2.	Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin	Member
3.	Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada	Member
4.	Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil	Member
5.	Senator Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch	Member
9.	Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar	Member
10.	Senator Begum Najma Hameed	Member

4. A list of officers/representatives of Ministry of Education, National Book Foundation (NBF), Pakistan Library Association (PLA), Islamabad, Pakistan Library Automation Group (PLAG) and others who attended the meeting is annexed.

5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada. At the outset of the meeting the honourable Chairman welcomed Secretary Education and other participants to the meeting and expressed his optimism that the Committee would profit with the rich and varied experience of Secretary, Education. He explained to the participants the existence of significant co-relation between reading habits of nation and its progress and prosperity. He outlined the role of “KUTAB KHANA’S” in the growth of Muslim civilization and attributed the existing stagnation, decline in moral and social values and intellectual standards to the erosion of reading habits among the people. The honourable Chairman also apprised the participants with his keen interest in the libraries and the efforts so far made by him in promotion of library culture in Pakistan.

6. Keeping in view the existing state of libraries in Pakistan he held the view that there is a dire need to introduce vibrancy in the existing Library culture in Pakistan. As such the Committee would focus and explore ways and means to move forward on the subject issue. In pursuit of this objective the Secretary Education and representatives of various organizations in the meeting would honestly evaluate the existing state of libraries in Pakistan and would present to the Committee suggestions and proposals for

reinvigoration and promotion of library culture in the country. He requested Secretary Education to brief the Committee as per agenda items.

7. The Secretary, Education gave an overview to the participants on the existing state of libraries under Ministry of Education. He informed that Department of Libraries, an attached Department of Ministry of Education, headed by a Director General oversees matters relating to Libraries and librarianship in the country and acts as a custodian of National Library heritage.

8. The jurisdiction of Ministry of Education is only confined to Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT). Presently, following categories of Libraries are functional under the Ministry:-

- i. National Library of Pakistan
- ii. Islamabad Public Library
- iii. Model Children Library
- iv. Islamabad Community Libraries (6)

9. In the wake of Lal Masjid operation material from Model Children Library has been shifted in the National Library of Pakistan building. The Children Library services are being extended through National Library at a limited scale. Referring to the measures being contemplated by the Ministry for promotion of library culture in Pakistan, the Secretary, Education informed that the Ministry has decided to establish 04 branches of National Libraries at Provincial Headquarters. The first such branch of National Library at Karachi would be functional during the current fiscal year 2009-10. The

Ministry has made mandatory for all publishers to provide copies of their publications to the proposed provincial libraries.

10. In addition to above, the Secretary Education informed that a Human Resource Development Centre (NHRDC), under the administrative control of Department of Libraries is also being established. The Centre would be set up on a floor of proposed building of Islamabad Public Library at F-10 Markaz, Islamabad. The Government is highly alive to the issue of promotion of Library culture in the country. The Education Policy, 2009 also envisages quite a few policy actions in this context.

11. Tracing back the subject issue the Secretary apprised the participants that in early 70's Ministry of Education established Pakistan National Centers wherein lecture rooms were also established to inculcate reading habits among the youths of the country but these were also later wound up. Subsequently, National Book Foundation also launched schemes titled "READERS CLUB" facilitating potential readers to purchase books at half their indicated prices. However, due to financial constraints this scheme has also been discontinued.

12. To a query made by Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal the honourable Chairman clarified that Libraries are a part of Federal subject. He referred to item No. 15 of Federal Legislative list of Constitution of Pakistan which read as under "**Libraries, museums and similar institutions controlled or financed by the Federation**".

13. The honourable Chairman expressed his concern that after 62 years of existence of Pakistan Ministry of Education is functional only in ICT. The Secretary Education also shared concerns of the honourable Chairman regarding neglected state of the Libraries and was of the view that a serious effort is needed to revamp and re-invigorate the library culture in Pakistan. He suggested for revival of Pakistan National Centers.

14. The Managing Director, National Book Foundation who is also Director General, Department of Libraries explained in detail infrastructure of the existing Public Libraries in Pakistan. The future plans as envisaged by Ministry of Education to make the reading milieu in the country more vibrant and conducive are listed as under:-

- i. Construction of Building for Islamabad Public Library.
- ii. Construction of Building for Model Children Library.
- iii. Strengthening of Resources and Services at Islamabad Community Libraries.
- iv. Up-gradation of Regional Offices as Branch National Libraries.
- v. Provision of Book Mobile service to senior citizens, handicapped and residents of Rural Areas of Islamabad.

15. The Managing Director solicited assistance of Committee for resolution of following Administrative/Financial constraints:-

- i. Community libraries are not provided with electricity.
- ii. Publishers do not send their books for Libraries.
- iii. The Libraries are under-staffed.
- iv. Specialized Libraries for children are not available.
- v. Islamabad Public Library in G-8 is not properly located.

- vi. Grants for the Libraries are not timely released.
- vii. CDA has not yet resolved the issue regarding construction of Building for Model Children Library.
- viii. There are no libraries for disabled and senior citizens.
- ix. Concept of mobile libraries needs to be revived.

16. Secretary, Pakistan Library Association, emphasized the need for inculcating reading habits in the students at primary level. He informed the Committee that Libraries in the primary schools in Islamabad are almost non-existent and the primary schools are devoid of services of trained libraries. On the basis of statistics available with him he informed the participants that out of 407 schools in Islamabad 266 schools impart Primary & Middle Education. These schools do not have any Library. Similarly, in the twenty-nine (29) colleges in Islamabad, only sixteen (16) colleges have qualified Librarians whereas thirteen (13) posts of Librarians are vacant. He solicited Committee's assistance for staffing the Libraries in schools and colleges with qualified Librarians and also for formulation and effective implementation of policies for promotion of library culture at primary level.

17. Secretary, Pakistan Library Automation Group (PLAG), a non-profit trust informed the participants that his group has developed a Pak LAG Koha, a web based multilingual integrated Library system to cater automation needs of medium to large libraries. He proposed to the Committee that Ministry of Education be requested to channelise this software for the benefit of readers. The group also stressed dire need for appointment of qualified librarians in schools/colleges. The Committee unanimously lauded the work

being done by PLAG and recommended that Ministry of Education should maintain a permanent liaison with the group and productively utilize the software developed by them.

18. The briefings were followed by an intensive question/answer session. The members made following suggestions to revamp the existing state of libraries and promote regarding habits among people:-

- i. Senator Mrs. Rehana Yahya Baloch informed the Committee that although the general conditions of schools in Balochistan are pathetic yet the administration of these schools still desire to have school libraries which are virtually non-existent in these schools. As such she proposed to the participants to take appropriate measures to set up libraries in the province at grossroot level. She suggested that a mechanism should be put in place to check theft of rare books from the official libraries of the province.
- ii. Senator Mrs. Dr. Saeeda Iqbal suggested that Ministry of Education should establish libraries in Government sectors where people belonging to middle and lower middle class live so as to provide them with an opportunity to read books. Due to exorbitant prices of books and economic crunch the purchase of books by people belonging to these social classes is unthinkable. In addition to this she also suggested that NBF besides their own building has another building which has been rented out. The NBF should get that building vacated and establish a library in it. The MD, NBF informed that the proposal is already in hand.
- iii. Senator Mrs. Suriya Amiruddin suggested that the Senators should invest their funds for establishment of libraries in the country.

- iv. Senator Dr. Abdul Khaliq Pirzada suggested that National Library Zone should be established in Islamabad, Internet system should be extensively utilized for promotion of reading culture and the government should develop an effective system to collect books from donors. In addition to this Ministry of Education should periodically arrange get-togethers of authors and publishers of books to create book reading culture.
- v. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar made following suggestions:-
 - a. The Government should accord priority to Education. In order to maintain continuity in policies the Ministers should not be changed frequently. Senator Dr. Mrs. Saeeda Iqbal dissented on the suggestion and held the view that the Government has right to change its Ministers whenever it feels appropriate.
 - b. Book Fairs should be organized in remote areas.
 - c. Reprint of books should be encouraged to make purchase of books affordable.
 - d. Old Book Banks should be established on large scale alongwith libraries.
 - e. The Ministry of Education should look into issue regarding conversion of an old Haveli in Pindi into a library. The matter is pending since long.

19. **There was consensus in the Committee that there is a dire need to legislate for maintaining and upgrading existing libraries in the country.**

20. The recommendations made by the Committee are summarized as under:-

- i. The Committee expressed its serious concern on the existing state of libraries in the country. After 62 years of existence of the country and mushroom growth of its population the existing number of libraries in Pakistan are insufficient and as such are not catering for its students, disabled and senior citizens. Instead of improving the libraries in Pakistan have deteriorated considerably and there is a dire need for an immediate action. In view of this the Committee recommended that the Ministry of Education should accord highest priority to this area.
- ii. The Committee recommended the need for legislation on libraries at Federal level. The Ministry of Education would present a draft law on libraries in Pakistan in the next meeting of the Committee.
- iii. The Committee took due cognizance of the fact that there is a growing urge among the people belonging to middle class and remote areas to progress in their lives and to improve their intellectual level and as such recommended that commercial libraries should be established in small cities, rural and remote areas.
- iv. The Committee took note of the fact that insufficient funds have been earmarked for establishment/up-gradation of libraries in the country. As such it recommended that adequate funding should be provided to the Ministry of Education specifically for libraries. The Prime Minister would be approached in this regard.
- v. Implementation of Copy Right Act should be ensured and this should be incorporated in the proposed legislation on the libraries.
- vi. Reading culture in the country is being eroded swiftly. As such Ministry of Education should create a social milieu to

promote reading habits among people belonging to all segments of the society.

- vii. National Book Foundation should organize Book Fairs not only in big cities but in remote and less developed areas to inculcate reading culture in the country.
 - viii. The Committee appreciated the work of Pakistan Library Automation group (PLAG), a registered volunteer body, playing a useful role in promotion of reading culture in the country and to boost profession of librarianship since 2000 and recommended that Ministry of Education should provide all possible assistance to the group and maintain liaison with it.
 - ix. The Ministry of Education should explore the possibility of public-private partnership for setting up of libraries in the country and for promotion of reading culture in the society.
21. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: **MINUTES OF THE MEETING TO RESOLVE GRIEVANCES OF 1000 PAKISTANI STUDENTS SPONSORED BY HEC TO STUDY MEDICINE IN CUBA**

The honourable Chairman of the Senate Standing Committee on Education presided over a meeting on 17th March, 2010 at 11:30 am in the Mural Hall of the Higher Education Commission (HEC), Islamabad to discuss the findings of the delegation deputed to Cuba to assess and to find solution of the grievances of the 1000 Pakistani students studying medicines in Cuba.

2. The meeting among others was attended by the Chairman, HEC, H.E. Cuban Ambassador and representatives of PMDC. A delegation comprising M/s Prof. Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshi, Advisor, HEC, Prof. Dr. Abdur Rasheed, Council Member, PMDC and Tahir Abbas Zahid, Project Director, HEC who visited Cuba on the subject issue apprised the participants of the meeting with their following recommendations/findings:-

- i. In order to streamline the Scholarship Programme, two proposed draft Agreements regarding the Programme and qualification of degrees between Government of Cuba and Government of Pakistan should be processed with immediate effect.
- ii. To ensure that students are trained appropriately and improvements are being made by Cuban authorities, a six monthly monitoring of the project as well as facilities may be conducted by HEC and PMDC.
- iii. Students demands, relating to PMDC may be taken up promptly including facility of house job in Pakistan and policy decision about NEB examination.
- iv. Special funds for sports, recreational facilities, improvement of residential facilities, improvement of residential and general living conditions including maintenance of wash rooms and fixing of Muslim showers, may be allocated by the Government of Pakistan.

- v. Gaps in the curriculum of two countries may be filled up by sending professors to be nominated by PMDC for a short period to teach the students at Cuba.
- vi. Medical books (English version) of all subjects may be purchased by the Government of Pakistan to be donated for the libraries at Cuba, primarily for use of Pakistani students.
- vii. Due to general lack of transport facilities, there is a need of a large transport pool to facilitate the movement of students in residential campuses and various hospitals. Government of Pakistan may consider the provision of at least three buses immediately (one for each group) and one van to maintain close liaison between Pakistan Embassy at Havana and the students.
- viii. Monthly stipend of students may be raised from 50 Euro to 100 Euro.
- ix. In order to lower the home sickness and psychological disturbances, Government of Pakistan may consider providing sufficient funds to HEC to meet the demands of students for two return air tickets during the course of studies. Moreover, mid study return air ticket for batch-II may be provided at the earliest as the vacations of students are starting very soon.
- x. A small liaison office comprising of two officials preferably doctors alongwith required office equipment and sufficient funds may be established in Cuba by the Government of Pakistan. Appropriate arrangements for shipment of student's clothings and necessary articles to Cuba may be made on biannual basis.
- xi. Compensation of the parents of student Daulat Ram (who died in Cuba in a road accident) may be granted.
- xii. Venues of cooperation like post graduate medical studies & research, training of nurses, biomedical technicians and other fields are worth exploring.
- xiii. Cuban authorities may be requested to initiate early steps for clinical placement of 606 students of batch-II.
- xiv. Cuban authorities may please be requested to provide a complete list of faculty members alongwith qualifications and a complete profile of University and all attached hospitals and Polyclinics, as already agreed upon during the visit of Pakistan delegation. It is required for the completion of report.

3. Similar recommendations were made by Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar who also visited Cuba to assess on the ground realities regarding grievances of the Pakistani students in Cuba. The honourable Senator expressed her dis-satisfaction on the food and other facilities being provided to the students.

4. The honourable H.E. Cuban Ambassador offered his congratulations to the members of the delegation on their successful trip to the Cuba. He appreciated the efforts made by the Government of Pakistan for expeditious resolutions of the concerns of the students as well as their parents regarding the standard of medical education in Cuba and various other allied facilities. The Government of Pakistan had all along been moving in the right direction to redress the grievances of the students. He informed the Committee that the Government of Cuba is highly pleased with the performance of the delegation in Cuba. Nevertheless, he expressed his cautious optimism regarding comprehensive resolution of the issue. He expressed his apprehension on the activities of a few ring leaders of the Pakistani students who are continuously provoking and inciting the students. As such the problems and issues may re-emerge.

5. The findings of the delegation were extensively deliberated by the participants of the meeting. The Vice President, PMDC held the view that the issue has two parts i.e. one relates to academic and the other to logistics. He held the view that parents of these 1000 students should have been involved to share the financial cost of the education. The financial implications involved in the education would have made them recognize the gravity of the situation. Further he informed the Committee that the students who acquire medical education abroad always study in a different system than is in vogue in Pakistan. He apprehended that the students studying in Cuba will not be able to qualify NEB exams conducted by PMDC for the foreign degree holders. To resolve this issue he proposed following options:-

- i. The PMDC may establish a separate integrated exams for the students in lieu of NEB examination conducted by PMDC.
 - ii. Teachers who have experienced in Integrated Education preferably those professionals teaching in Agha Khan Hospital, Karachi and Ziauddin University, Karachi should visit students on regular basis. Teaching facilities in Karachi and Islamabad can also be utilized in this context.
 - iii. Ring leaders of students should be penalized.
6. After extensive discussion the Committee made following recommendations:-
- i. The monthly stipend of the students should be increased to 100 Euro.
 - ii. The PC-I of the project presently under submission to the Planning Commission should incorporate provision of a return air ticket for the students.
7. The honourable Chairman Senate Standing Committee discussed the afore-listed recommendations with the Dr. Ishfaq Ahmed, Dy. Chairman, Planning Commission and Dr. Samar Mubarkmand, Member, Science and Technology. Both these officers have given positive response to support the recommendations particularly relating to provision of return air tickets to the students who due in March, 2010. This information has been conveyed by the honourable Chairman to Dr. Javaid R. Laghari, Chairman, HEC who is likely to attend meeting of the CDWP.

Sd/-

(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-

(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: - MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION HELD ON 27TH MAY, 2010 AT ISLAMABAD

A meeting of the Senate Standing Committee on Education was held on 27th May, 2010 at 3:00 p.m. in the Committee Room No. 4, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.

2. The agenda before the Committee was as under:-
 - x. Briefing on:-
 1. Charter, structure, performance and achievements of Allama Iqbal Open University during the year 2009-10.
 2. Stoppage of stipend to Pakistani students studying in China.
 3. Non-payment of salaries for the last six months to the IT staff of Schools under Federal Directorate of Education, Islamabad.
 - xi. Any other item with the permission of chair.
3. The following members of the Committee attended the meeting:-
 1. Senator Haifz Rashid Ahmed
 2. Senator Suriya Amiruddin
 12. Senator Mrs. Farah Aqil
 13. Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan
 14. Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali
 15. Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar
 16. Senator Begum Najma Hameed
4. A list of officers of Ministry of Education and other invitees who attended the meeting is annexed.

5. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran by Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan. Thereafter, the honourable Chairman welcomed all the participants to the meeting. He expressed his gratitude to all the participants that despite hot and sultry weather the participants have managed to come to the meeting. Prior to taking up the formal agenda of the meeting the honourable Chairman expressed his deep disappointment that despite persistent pointification of various shortcomings in the education system of Pakistan by the Standing Committee in its various meetings the Government of Pakistan have failed to rectify the system. The education system in Pakistan is a victim of deep neglect of the Government. The Standing Committee in its various meetings had repeatedly pointed out that the basic cause for the deterioration in the education system in Pakistan is the paucity of funds. As such to bridge the yawning fiscal gap the Committee had proposed allocation of 7% of GDP to the education sector of Pakistan. The proposed allocation would have contributed for building up the education system in Pakistan on sound foundation. To the utter dismay, the average annual allocation to the education system in Pakistan had only been 2.4% of the GDP. Out of this allocation 1.76% had reportedly been absorbed in the system and the rest lapsed because of bureaucratic rigmarole. Moreover, there had been no barometer to ensure that the little investments made in education sector has been done rightly. Consequently, the education system in Pakistan instead of moving upwards had been continuously on the downhill. The picture of education in Pakistan looks more gloomy if compare it with the countries around it where the allocation to education sector is over 4% of the GDP.

6. Nevertheless, the honourable Chairman of the Committee expressed his optimism while referring to the 18th amendment in the constitution of Pakistan wherein the responsibilities of education have been devolved to the provinces and NFC Award has enriched the provinces to enable them to expend more on education. The 18th amendment has also bestowed education as a basic right to children in the age group of 5 to 16 years. The children falling in

the aforesaid age group would receive free education. He hoped that the amendment is implemented in the province in letter and spirit for improvement of the education sector. He informed the Committee that the next meeting of the Committee would exclusively devote to secure the basic right of education for the children of Pakistan. The Committee would propose a mechanism so as to optimally achieve the benefits of 18th amendment vis-a-vis education sector in Pakistan. He also desired that the judiciary in Pakistan should also come forward and help the society in giving practical shape to the basic right for education. He requested the Vice Chancellor of Allama Iqbal Open University to give briefing to the participants as per agenda.

Item No. i (a)

7. Prof. Dr. Nazir A. Sangi, Vice Chancellor of Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) gave a detailed briefing to the Committee on charter, performance, achievements of the university. The main features of the briefing given by the officer are detailed as under:-

- i. Administrative structure
- ii. Regional network
- xii. Academic System
- xiii. AIOU Service System
- xiv. Conventional face to face education
- xv. Salient features of the various courses
- xvi. Curriculum of various courses

8. The briefing was followed by an intensive question/answer session. The honourable Vice Chancellor of AIOU responding to various queries of the honourable members of the Committee informed that the principal focus of the university is to impart best possible education to those students who because of social and financial constraints are not in a position to attend universities/colleges

on regular basis. The students enrolled with the university are taught by the locally available tutors. Approximately one tutor is allocated for 100 students. In addition to this local teachers also provide assistance to the students. The tutors hold fortnightly meetings with the students. The prescribed books for each course are made available to the enrolled students in each province on subsidized rates i.e. on no profit and no loss basis. In addition to this the AIOU has also developed CDs especially for students attending computer courses, established by AIOU on world class curriculum. These CDs are supplemented with theoretical classes also. With the introduction of CDs in 2005 there had been 3 to 11% improvement in the results. In addition to this workshops are conducted and in some courses field visits are also made. Referring to face to face mode of academic system of the university the honourable Vice Chancellor informed the Committee that the students invariably have meetings with their assigned tutors on a predetermined schedule and an online system of education is conducted wherein internet café provide a useful link to the students with the university. The education through video conferencing has also been experimented and would be also widely made available.

9. The honourable Vice Chancellor responding to the query of honourable Chairman of the Committee regarding the system of monitoring in place by the university informed that the education being imparted to the students by the university is monitored by the its Regional Offices. In addition to this the Research and Evaluation Centre of the University also does random surveys in this context and the statistics/information gathered on the basis of these surveys is subsequently analyzed for bringing improvement in the system. The officer further informed that the system of monitoring the quality of education is being implemented down to district and tehsil level. The AIOU is also considering proposal to seek assistance of various provincial universities in monitoring of education being imparted by it. However, there is a persistent complaint from the students regarding belated delivery of relevant books and

courses materials to the students by the Post Office. The University takes due cognizance of the complaints and tries its best to improve the system.

10. Furthermore, the honourable Vice Chancellor also informed that a satellite project is also in hand. The total cost of the project is Rs. 390 million. The project could not take off as yet because of non-availability of the funds. He also informed that AIOU is also a member of mega universities. Lately, a conference of mega universities was held in China wherein AIOU also participated. He informed the Committee that in the year 2009 3,309,416 students were enrolled for various courses in the AIOU. Of the total enrollment 56% were female and 44% were male. The province-wise breakup (%) is as under:-

Punjab	69%
Islamabad	4%
Sindh	4%
Baluchistan	2%
Khyer Pakhtoon Khawa	12%
Azad Kashmir	7%
Northern Areas	1%

11. The honourable Chairman inquired from the Vice Chancellor as to the reason of low percentage of student enrollment in Sindh and Baluchistan. He informed that presently AIOU has established seven offices in Sindh and four offices in Baluchistan. The low enrollment of students from these two provinces is attributable to the lack of paying capacity of the students. **The issue was further deliberated and it was decided that students residing in Islamabad or other regions of the Punjab but are originally domiciled in the other provinces should be counted in the list of students of their original domiciled regions/provinces on the basis of their registration number which also identifies their district. This would give a true picture of**

provincial representation of student enrollment in AIOU. The Committee unanimously endorsed the proposal.

12. Responding to a query of the honourable Chairman regarding the system of examination being followed by AIOU, the honourable Vice Chancellor informed that AIOU has 850 examination centers combined for males and females. The examinations are conducted on semester basis throughout the country. He informed the Committee that overall pass percentage is 66% approximately and course-wise it is approximately 25 to 85%.

13. The Secretary, Ministry of Education giving his views on the standard of education being imparted by the AIOU informed the Committee that over a period of time the scope of AIOU has widened which has adversely affected the quality of education of AIOU. The decline in the level of education is also due to the fact that qualified and well trained teachers are not recruited by AIOU. The honourable Vice Chancellor admitted that there are problems and issues which are hampering the quality of education being imparted by the university. However, the basic objective of the university is to provide access to education to all the citizens of the country as formal system of education is not available to them. The available services in the university are being improved and the focus is on students teachers meetings so as to provide maximum possible opportunities to the students to interact with their teachers. The teachers are recruited from the available education system. The AIOU envisages recruitment of 47.5 million teachers to train them in the distant learning. However, the university could not get the requisite funds.

14. **The honourable Chairman expressed his reservations on the efficient functioning of AIOU. In this regard he quoted an application of Mr. Tariq Mehmood resident of House No. R-379, Saidpuri Gate, Rawalpindi. The petitioner had addressed the application to the Programme Coordinator of the AIOU wherein he has pointed out inefficiency of the**

system of education of AIOU. The honourable Vice Chancellor informed the Committee that such incidents do come to his notice. However, the application referred to by the honourable Chairman of the Committee is in his knowledge and he is investigating the contents of the petition. The honourable Chairman directed that a comprehensive report on the petition be made available to the Committee at the earliest.

15. The honourable Senator Begum Najma Hameed inquired from the honourable Vice Chancellor regarding number of graduates of the AIOU who are presently holding important positions in the public/private sector or are associated with the educational institutions of the country. He informed that the present Chairman of the PTCL had been a student of AIOU. He could not give the details in respect of other graduates as inquired by the honourable Senator. However, the Chairman requested him to provide details of such graduates in the next meeting of the Committee.

16. The honourable Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali, Deputy Chairman Senate drew attention of the Committee to the recent incidents of target killings of educationists in the province of Baluchistan. He requested the Chairman of the committee that the committee should take due notice of it and move a resolution in the House highlighting the sensitivity of the issue and adoption of measures to curb the growing incidents of target killings. The honourable Chairman duly appreciated the point brought out by the honourable Senator and requested Senator Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim to draft the resolution at the earliest.

17. The honourable Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar informed the Committee that she had been associated with the process of selecting candidates for various posts. On the basis of the interviews conducted by her she had noticed that students in Pakistan has difficulty in expressing themselves in the English language. As such the AIOU should focus on building the capacity

of student both in speaking and writing of English language. **Concluding the briefing given by the honourable Vice Chancellor of AIOU the Chairman informed that the Committee would shortly pay a visit to the AIOU.**

Item No. i (b)

18. The Secretary Education informed that Ministry of Education launched a scheme “**Subsidy to Scholars Abroad under Cultural Exchange Programme**” in 1980 to supplement the scholarship amount @US\$ 25 per month for Master and Ph. D studies. The amount of subsidy was raised to US\$ 50 per month in 1988 and US\$ 114 per month in 1995. The subsidy scheme was suspended in 1998 due to financial constraints. The subsidy was restored in 2003 under the Prime Minister’s Directive. A scheme was prepared at a capital cost of Rs. 132.75 million for five years which was approved by CDWP on 18.05.2004.

19. Under the scheme, Government of Pakistan provides subsidy to scholars @ US\$ 200/- per month for general studies and @ US\$ 300/- per month for Ph. D studies. This scheme was for the period 2004-05 to 2009-10. But the allocation in the PC-I exhausted in 2008-09 due to 130 additional scholarships offered by China for M.Phil/Ph.D. studies during the years 2006, 2007 & 2008 in addition to the actual quota of 65 scholarships (at one time) offered by the Chinese Government every year.

20. The scheme was revised at a capital cost of Rs. 345 million and extended for five years (2009-2014). There was no problem in release of scholarships to the students except in the financial years 2008-09 and 2009-10. So far, an amount of Rs. 34 million has been released for payment to the scholars studying abroad. HEC has been requested to remit the remaining amount of Rs. 44.5 million in Foreign Exchange (FEC) to Pakistan Missions

abroad. HEC has already initiated the process for release of funds which will be remitted to the Pakistani Missions abroad including China within a week.

Item No. i (c)

21. The Secretary, Ministry of Education explaining the issue informed that the issue took birth because of the hasty decisions of the Government and its resolution is lingering since last two to three years. Initially the Federal Government decided that evening classes should be started in the schools located in Islamabad. Subsequently, the Cabinet also decided to start IT classes in the schools under Federal Directorate of Education (FDE). As such a Departmental Selection Committee was constituted and following staff were recruited on contract basis:-

i.	Computer Lecturers	18
ii.	Senior Computer Teachers	72
iii.	Computer Lab Incharge	81
iv.	Computer Lab Attendants	81
	Total	<u>252</u>

22. The project for which the above appointments were made was initially for a period of three years. After expiry of three years the AGPR withheld salaries of the employees. As such the Ministry of Education initiated a case for regularization of the services of officers/officials recruited on contract basis. Of 252 employees there are 125 such employees whose services could only be regularized through FPSC. When the Ministry of Education approached FPSC they informed that the services of these employees could only be regularized in the light of relevant recruitment rules of the posts and application of regional/provincial quotas. To this the incumbents of the posts objected and filed a suit in the Court of Law. Similarly, the remaining employees also filed a suit in the Court of Law against their regularization through a Departmental Selection Committee. The matter is still pending before the Court of Law and the outcome

is still awaited. Nevertheless, the FDE has granted extension in the contractual period of the employees upto 30.06.2010 and AGPR has released their salaries.

Item No. ii

23. The Committee took up the issue regarding relocation of fifteen (15) Pakistani students who were offered scholarships by the Government of Cuba for medical education in that country. The honourable Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar explained to the Committee the details of the issue. She also apprised the Committee with the findings of her visit to Cuba. The Committee taking due cognizance of the issue constituted a Sub-Committee comprising following members to look into the possible relocation of the fifteen (15) students in the medical colleges in Pakistan:-

- | | | |
|------|----------------------------------|----------|
| i. | Senator Mrs. Nilofar Bakhtiar | Convener |
| ii. | Senator Jan Muhammad Khan Jamali | Member |
| iii. | Senator Begum Najma Hameed | Member |

24. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Sd/-
(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-
(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
Chairman Standing Committee
on Education

SENATE SECRETARIAT

Subject: **MINUTES OF MEETING OF CHAIRMAN, SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION WITH H.E. CUBAN AMBASSADOR HELD ON 11TH FEBRUARY, 2010**

Pursuant to recommendation made in the requisitioned meeting of Senate Standing Committee on Education held on February 8, 2010 in the Parliament House, Islamabad, the Chairman, Senate Standing Committee on Education held a meeting with H.E. Cuban Ambassador at 3:00 pm in the office of Chairman, Higher Education Commission to find solutions to various problems being faced by 932 Pakistani students studying in medical schools in Cuba on Cuban scholarship.

2. The H.E. Cuban Ambassador explaining briefly the background of the 1000 Cuban Scholarship Programme for medical studies offered to the Government of Pakistan informed the Chairman that the medical brigade which visited Pakistan on the eve of devastating earthquake of October, 2005 was deeply moved by the death and misery caused in the affected regions. The medical brigade while offering medical assistance to the earthquake affectees came across a few people who informed the Cuban medical personnel that they have never seen a doctor in their entire life. This statement of the affected people deeply moved the Government of Cuba who decided that the best possible way to overcome deprivation of the earthquake affectees would be to offer to Pakistan Government 1000 Cuban Scholarship Programme for medical studies in Cuba. Two hundred (200) seats of this programme were allocated for students hailing from earthquake affected areas with the objective that these students being familiar with the social and cultural norms of the region would be best able to serve the people of the region.

3. The Ambassador highlighted the brotherly relations with the Government of Pakistan. He informed that right from the launching of the programme the Government of Cuba did not conceal anything from the Higher Education Commission (HEC) regarding the contents of the programme. He

presumed that the Government of Pakistan and the Higher Education Commission had also selected these students in a highly transparent way. **Dilating on the various aspects of the programme he emphatically emphasized that the curriculum of studies programme for the Pakistani students under this project will be the same as the Latin American School of Medicines (ELAM). This is the programme of studies for all the foreign students in Cuba and a medical degree from ELAM will be issued to the Pakistani students after successful completion of their studies. He dispelled the notion that the Pakistani students studying medical education in Cuba after completion of their studies would be awarded a certificate. The Embassy of Republic of Cuba had confirmed this vide their letter dated November 12, 2007 issued to HEC.** Furthermore, he informed that the standard of Cuban medical education is one of the best in the world. Presently, 26000 foreign medical students from 36 countries are studying in medical colleges in Cuba. The standard of medical education in Cuba can be best gauged by the fact that even the American doctors practicing in USA have acquired medical degrees from Cuba. There is a uniform system of medical education in Cuba and degrees acquired from its medical schools have an equal value. The Government of Cuba has introduced an Integrated Medical System of education. Due to lack of morbidity in Cuba the students are not taught on the actual dead bodies but on the basis of computer animations of the various parts of the bodies. In the first two years of medical education the students are imparted purely theoretical education. Subsequent, to this they are rotated to different hospitals. The first batch of Pakistani students are due for rotation in the batches of 330 students each. They would be thus relocate to the nearest hospitals. **Against this background the honourable Ambassador also informed the Chairman Committee that the students are now insisting that they should not be disbursed to different hospitals and should be kept together which is an unacceptable demand as per Cuban system of education.**

4. The scholarship programme was offered by the Government of Cuba in the year 2006. The Ambassador informed the honourable Chairman,

Standing Committee that ever since the launching of programme he had been repeatedly clarifying issues related to the programme to HEC. The programme was offered to the Government of Pakistan purely on the basis of brotherly relations and humanitarian consideration. As such he had been deeply hurt by baseless reports/comments appearing in the Pakistani media from time to time. **He, therefore, requested that these controversies should now be closed.**

5. The honourable Chairman Standing Committee inquired from the H.E. Ambassador of Cuba reasons regarding the reported dis-satisfaction and frustration among the Pakistani students in Cuba. The Ambassador explained that he do not have any exact clue about this but he is confident enough that the dis-satisfaction and frustration is only among a specific group of the students. 95% of the reported issues regarding standard of education and living conditions as being reported in Pakistan are baseless. He informed the Chairman that there are no big university campuses in Cuba like those in USA, UK and other developed countries. There are only three university campuses in Cuba. The Government of Cuba is facing problems only with a campus wherein the Pakistani students are putting up. His country is poor. Despite lack of resources the Government of Cuba is spending a huge amount on the import of Halal food as per demanded by the Pakistani students. **The Pakistani students time and again make odd demands for example they refused to eat even the Halal meat unless a certificate to the effect is shown to them. They also requested for provision of necessary television network to enable them to see GEO and PTV. The Government of Cuba honoured their request and made necessary arrangements.** The Pakistani students are presently on strike. Their strike has now entered 22nd day. The Dy. Minister and other Cuban high officials had requested the Pakistani students to call off their strike but the students have not budged an inch and are exhibiting a very stubborn towards the Cuban Government. The Government of Cuba is not used to such strikes, their patience may get exhausted and consequently may take necessary action as per their rules.

6. The representative of the PMDC informed the Chairman that since the Pakistani students as committed by the H.E. Cuban Ambassador would be awarded a medical degree duly recognized by WHO. They would accept these students provided they pass PMDC's examination (NEB) as required by other foreign students.

7. Against above perspective the honourable Chairman decided to have Tele-Conference with Prof. Masood Hameed, Vice Chancellor, Dow Medical College, Karachi on February 12, 2010 before giving his final recommendation on the subject issue.

Sd/-
(ABDUL SAMI KHAN)
JS/Secretary Committee

Sd/-
(SENATOR S.M. ZAFAR)
**Chairman Standing Committee
on Education**